ONLINE APPENDIX ONE

Table One: Qualitative Studies of Network Governance 2000-2017

Study	Journal*	Theme and theoretical perspective	Qualitative Method	Analytic Approach	Presentation of findings	Key contributions
1. Bartelings et al. 2017	PMR	Focuses on orchestrational work of network managers. Situated in the literature on managerial work, and Mintzberg in particular. Takes account of emerging recognition of orchestrational work in collaborative contexts.	Structured participatory observation premised on partial replication and extension of Mintzberg's (1970) study. 36 observers of 9 managers over 52 days. Clear overview of (student) observer training, data collection materials and supports. The sampling criteria and process are outlined, as is the data collection process.	Data analysed thematically on the basis of an inductive approach, drawing on, deductive themes. A comprehensive overview of the research approach is provided although detail on the analytical approach is somewhat limited.	Combination of telling and showing. The nature and prevalence of managerial roles are summarised in 2 tables. An accompanying narrative develops findings regarding orchestrational tasks, illustrated using quotes.	Network management roles contain the 10 traditional management roles outlined by Mintzberg, albeit in different proportions, together with seven additional orchestrational tasks. The individual level focus complements existing higher level contributions to understanding network management.
2. Mandell et al. 2017	PMR	Focuses on impact of language on enabling collaborative network to operate cohesively. Draws upon literature on language and types of collaborative networks to note absence of consideration of language in network research and the particular deficit of management language for the challenges faced	Secondary data analysis of two existing case studies. Original cases comprised interviews, focus groups and documentation. Less detail provided on volume of data, sampling or number/length of interviews and focus groups provided.	Thematic analysis premised on coding around key concepts and subsequent generation of higher-level themes. Considered frequency and overlap of the formation, use and application of language. Process of analysis described in brief.	Combination of telling and showing. Case finding are presented in narrative form with illustrative quotes and excerpts of secondary data.	Highlights role of language in the formation and functioning of collaborative networks. Identifies its role in: building cohesion between network members; forging collaborative progress by setting the tone for the network and mobilising action and; embedding supportive language into network operations.

		by collaborative networks.			
3. Qvist 2017	PA	Focuses on how meta-governance influence network formation.	Two-part study between 2006-2011. Part 1 premised on 20 interviews with public servants, observation and document analysis. Interview focus succinctly outlined. Part 2 premised on 4 municipal cases. 2 cases (25 interviews) initially undertaken with two further cases (22 interviews) undertaken due to unanticipated findings. The case sampling rationale is clearly detailed and interview themes provided.	Four over-arching themes informed the data analysis but analytic process not explicated in detail.	Combination of telling and showing. Narrative overview of findings with interview excerpts used to illustrate points.	Enhances understanding of network responses to meta-governance. This can result in the founding of networks on the basis of identification as well as previously recognized interdependence.
4. Isett and Miranda 2015	PMR	Focuses on effects of context and structure on co-production through study of local collaboratives. Analysis is situated within co-production literature.	Study of 15 local collaboratives, interview data gathered at two points in time: 2005 and 2006-7. Data gathering technique and rationale clearly detailed.	Combination of deductive and inductive themes, applied iteratively. Coding informed by theory but not elaborated in full.	Combination of telling and showing. Data demonstrated by integrating quotes into text, discussion of findings and also through incorporation of a large table containing representative quotes for each of six themes identified.	Key areas of design difficult to implement, resulting in a top-down environment. New governance structures can be implemented but underlying cultures have to shift. Otherwise systems will remain single-layered and command and control, prompting frustration and animosity
5. Mischen 2015	PMR	Examines factors contributing to network effectiveness. Synthesizes literature on collaborative	Comparative case analysis of two networks. Data gathered from 14 interview participants. Interview protocol with	Deductive and iterative coding process described with inclusion of table in an appendix that provides	Combination of telling and substantial showing. Data are discussed at length in the text with extensive use of direct	Findings indicate that network success depends upon need for social, financial and knowledge capital, and the capacity to manage these through

		governance and knowledge management to develop integrated theory of network capacity.	indicative questions is provided in an appendix.	collaborative governance and knowledge management codes.	quotations for illustration and elaboration purposes.	collaborative network management.
6. Poocharoen and Ting, 2015	PMR	Focuses on coproduction in networks, and factors supporting effectiveness. Synthesizes literature on collaboration, co-production and networks to develop a framework for analysis.	Network analysis approach underpinned with qualitative interview data and secondary data (archival) analysis conducted between 2010 and 2012. Detailed discussion of sampling with networks under study reduced from 24 to 10 to 4. Little specific detail on interview participants and content of interviews provided.	Less information on data analysis is provided within the methods section.	Reliance on telling. Authors provide a detailed account of the networks and their key characteristics. Key features and structures are illustrated in tabular and figurative form. Interview quotations do not feature in the account.	The authors outline a framework comprising four dimensions of co-production. Findings provide insight into structures, processes and actors' role in supporting performance.
7. Saz-Carranza et al. 2016	PAR	Focuses on the role of power within the development of network administrative organizations in order to generate theory on the effective governance of mandated networks.	Comparative case study with comprehensive detail of sampling, cases and data collection, including table profiling of 25 interviewees. Interview themes and approach detailed.	Combined deductive and inductive approach. Detailed discussion of coding development process, accompanied by table indicating route from initial codes to reported findings.	Combination of showing and telling. Diagrams indicate the form, mobilization and dialectics of the case study networks. Numerous quotations provided in text discussion to substantiate and illustrate author interpretation.	Demonstrates that the conception and development of policy-mandated networks is a bargaining process characterized by conflict. Presents six propositions, three of which relate to the bargaining process with a further three elaborating the role of resource dependencies.

8. Vangen et al. 2015	PMR	Focuses on governing cross-sector inter-organizational collaborations. Literature review identifies competing and complementary logics relative to 'collaborative governance' and 'governing collaborations'.	Longitudinal case study. 24 field notes drawn from 15 interviews conducted between 2011-12 and data drawn from observations, world café and documents. Interview themes are detailed.	Thematic coding scheme developed iteratively, premised on combination of deductive and inductive themes. Brief explanation of coding process in methods section but no examples provided.	Reliance on telling. The authors provide an account of the governance of the collaboration for the reader. Few direct quotations from interviews, notes or documents are provided.	Highlights a distinction between governance of collaboration and collaborative governance relative to structures, processes and actors. Demonstrates how each of these shapes the direction and outcomes of collaboration.
9. Voets et al. 2015	PMR	Focuses on 'smart meta-governance', drawing on literature on meta-governance roles and strategies.	Single case study research design, derived from two research studies (2009-11 and 2010-2011) Brief detail on 14 interviews and 10 focus groups (with 78 participants) is provided.	Secondary analysis undertaken, with original references noted. Analytic and coding processes only briefly described.	Telling is predominant. The authors provide an account of the network under analysis. A figure and table summarize the actors, structures and features of the governance under analysis but very few direct quotations are included.	Provides insights into factors contributing to meta-governance failure (and success) through understanding that failure is contingent on context – specifically the policy issue and system concerned.
10. Chapman and Lowndes 2014	PA	Focuses on network governance within context of politics and democracy. Examines the role and legitimacy of non-elected representation in urban governance partnerships.	Single 'faith representation' case study comprising 88 interviews conducted between 2005 and 2012 Data gathering techniques and sources are well documented and characteristics of participants are reported. Interview themes are explicit. Data are compiled into vignettes. Used peer de-	Analytic process (narrative analysis) briefly described. Deductively informed with induction implied. Analysis aimed to test, extend and deepen their conceptual framework. Rationale for use of vignettes and themes underpinning them is detailed.	Combination of telling and showing. Data presented in the form of 6 vignettes of selected illustrative representatives. 'Showing' takes the form of short data excerpts interwoven in the vignettes.	Effective network governance requires better understanding of the roles of elected and non-elected representatives. Propositions suggest that non-elected representatives have potential to deliver broader, deeper, smarter and edgier representation within network governance systems.

			briefing and member checking to validate interpretations.			
11. Ferlie and McGivern 2014*	JPART	Examines the governance of health networks, informed by a Foucauldian Governmentality perspective	Comparative case study analysis of two networks. Case studies and wider project background are discussed in some detail. Topic content of 24 interviews and 9 meeting observations briefly described.	Iterative analytic approach with deductive and inductive elements, resembling abduction. Details on coding process are provided in brief.	Combination of telling and showing. Extensive use of quotations from documentary sources and interviews throughout findings section. Explicit connection with theory throughout.	The governmentality approach enables a distinctive analysis of power within networks along with the appreciation of the role of 'grey sciences'. New governance structures create space for clinical-manager hybrids to maintain discretion and influence Contributions summarized in tabular form.
12. van Oortmerssen et al. 2014	PMR	Focuses on the connection between trust and conversational interaction in collaborative governance. Situated relative to debates on trust including those derived from conversational interaction and collaborative settings.	Exploratory and instrumental single case study with data and observation gathered 2007-2008. A detailed discussion of the case is provided. Extensive provision of details of participants and subject content of interviews. Overview of data collection processes in figure form.	An interpretive and abductive analytic approach. Detailed discussion of coding process in methods section.	Combination of telling and showing. The authors provide a rich account of the data that is supplemented by numerous interview and observation extracts.	Illustrates a virtual circle with trust increasing quality of interaction, and interaction increasing trust. Conversational interaction increases trust through an increased openness, responsiveness and speed.
13. Conteh 2013	PMR	Focuses on strategic inter-organizational cooperation in complex environments and subsequent implications for strategic goals. Draws on collaborative and strategic	Comparative case study approach. Detailed discussion of cases based on document review, but little information on interview participants and subject content provided.	Inductive process of analysis. Process of tracing and constructing a narrative is noted in brief but not explained in detail.	Reliance on telling. Authors provide a detailed account of the case organizations and findings. Primary data in the form of quotations from interviews and documents not employed	Adds to understanding of policy governance in terms of a strategic, rather than operational, set of processes and outcomes. Sheds light on the ways public agencies engage in adaptation to their environments.

		management literature, relative to public services.			to supplement the author account.	
14. Reynaers 2014	PAR	Explores the impact of public value on PPPs. Literature discussions centre on PPPs and the concept of public value.	Single case study approach, which is outlined and justified. Data drawn from 19 interviews with public servants. Subject content of interviews discussed in the methods section with examples of questions provided.	Combined inductive/deductive approach to analysis. Coding discussed briefly with over-arching themes provided in a table.	Combination of telling and showing. Author interpretation of data provided in relation to key themes with some illustrative quotations.	Shows that the relationship between collaborative organization and public values is dependent upon the nature of initial project phase and the element of public value under examination.
15. Walker et al. 2013	PAR	Identifies enablers/ barriers in collaborative procurement. Focuses on the relational theory perspective in addition to literature on collaborative procurement.	Sequential and exploratory mixed-methods approach. Data consists of counts derived from 51 interviews with public servants drawn from 20 organizations, plus documentary sources. Limited information on subject content of interviews.	Deductive approach to analysis with emergent modifications to existing themes and new inductive themes. Coding process briefly described in a paragraph in the methods section but limited information on actual codes in use. .	Predominance of telling with some showing. Extensive provision of summary data in numerical form in three tables. Predominantly offers author interpretation. However, the findings section incorporates some direct quotations from policy and government reports.	A relational lens helps to illuminate and identify collaborative procurement-specific enablers and barriers, e.g. lack of common coding systems.
16.Waring et al. 2013*	PAR	Focuses on ways PPPs shape service and workforce organization. Detailed discussion of literature on PPPs, identifying variety in implementation and organization.	Comparative ethnographic case study approach. Detailed discussion of comparative cases and selection process. 600 hours of observation, 72 interviews and documentary data undertaken between 2006-2009.	Inductive, grounded theory approach to analysis. Detailed discussion of coding process over three paragraphs. Diagrammatic summary detailing codes is provided.	Combination of telling and extensive showing. Illustrative examples of data provided in tables to demonstrate variation and similarities between cases. Numerous quotations presented in text to	Offers an 'inside the box' perspective on PPPs, leading to development of 4 empirically grounded concepts which mediate relationships between up-stream partnership arrangements and down-stream organization and management.

			Detail of participants provided and brief discussion of interview subject content.		elaborate discussion of findings. Extracts from field notes and documentary sources are also provided.	
17. Moynihan, 2012.	GOV	Evaluates response to crisis to shed light on role of 'blame avoidance' in network governance. Situated relative to literature on blame, organizational reputation and network characteristics.	Single case study design focused on the response to Hurricane Katrina. Detailed justification of single case study approach provided in methods section. Qualitative data drawn from official report and hearings of House and Senate Committees.	Inductive approach conducted with QSR N6 software. Thematic codes described in detail in dedicated section on data analysis.	Predominantly telling with some showing. Presentation of findings through thematic narrative account with small interwoven excerpts of data.	Identifies the significance of 'extra-network reputation' and consequences of blaming within networks. Theoretical implications for accountability, transparency and network failure identified.
18. Romzek et al. 2012	PAR	Examines notion and practice of informal accountability in non-profit social networks. Aims to develop a preliminary theory' of informal accountability.	Multiple case study design with data drawn from a wider research project. Interviews conducted with 22 participants from 11 non-profit organizations in 2008-2009. Discussion of length and subject content of interviews in methods section.	Exploratory, inductive, grounded theory approach. Brief description of 'open' coding process in a paragraph in methods section with three over-arching themes identified.	Combination of telling and showing. Discussion of findings is interspersed with illustrative and representative interview quotations for some themes.	Proposes new theory of informal accountability within networks, informed by a range of social norms, informal systems of rewards and sanctions, and organizational obstacles.
19. Martin 2011	PA	Analyses challenges in broadening public sector governance networks. Literature reviews specific rising role of third sector and user involvement in public service governance.	Single case study research design. Extensive discussion of the case – a cancer-genetics network. Collection and subject content of data derived from 9 meetings and 56 interviews is discussed in detail in methods section.	Mixed inductive and deductive approach. Analytic coding process described over two paragraphs in the methods section. An accompanying table provides a summary of the codes employed.	Combination of telling and showing. Author account of the data is rich and supplemented with extensive data extracts. In addition, the table linking data and coding frameworks provides further support for the	Adds to growing body of knowledge on the effects of third sector and user involvement within public service networks. Highlights in particular the facilitative role of the third sector but also structural and cultural factors which limit effective user and third sector

					author account.	involvement.
20. Nolte and Boenigk 2011	PA	Sets out to develop a process model to support evaluation of inter-sectoral partnerships. Situated relative to literature on public-non-profit partnerships.	Single case study research design. Discussion of data sources in the form of 7 interviews and documents collected and analysed in 2010.	Interview questions and analytic codes deductively derived. Codes extended during analysis to reflect emergent themes (e.g. induction). Less detail is provided on the analytic approach or data analysis process.	Combination of telling and showing. Authors provide a rich account of the case that is supplemented by numerous extracts from interviews and documents. A summary of the case study analysis is also provided in tabular form.	Finds that disaster situations and responses can lead to growth of, and improved commitment to, a network. Highlights importance of network inputs (communication, trust, experience), and outputs (time and quality measures).
18. Saz-Carranza and Ospina 2011*	JPART	Focuses on network effectiveness through behavioural dimensions of networks, with specific focus upon unity-diversity tensions. Combination of perspectives including theory on organizational, group and collaborative behaviour. Aims to build and elaborate rather than test theory, through whole network analysis.	Four case studies drawn from two interpretive comparative interview studies (2002-2004 and 2006-2006). Detailed discussion of sampling and data collection over 6 paragraphs. Interview themes are outlined. Tables incorporated which summarize research design and information on interview participants.	Inductive and abductive (combining inductive / deductive aspects) approaches were adopted Coding processes discussed over three paragraphs with a table summarizing route from initial coding to reported findings. Cases discussed in detail with accompanying table that outlines key characteristics of each.	Telling combined with extensive showing. Data presented in form of illustrative quotations within text discussion. Table (over 6 pages) contains illustrative quotations by theme and by network. Further table providing supporting data is included.	The empirical exploration of the behavioral dimensions of networks illuminates the 'how and why' of network governance and contributes to understanding of network effectiveness.
22. Campbell 2012	PAR	Examines extent of 'workarounds' – evasion of policy directives - within integrated service	Single case study. Focused upon 69 interviews drawn from wider sample of 300. Subject content of	Inductive approach with detail of the three-step coding and analysis process provided in methods	Combination of telling and showing. Interview quotations used in text to illustrate discussion points.	Defines and identifies workarounds in practice and outlines implications for debates on administrative discretion vs. accountability.

		collaboratives. Analysis situated in literature on integrated services and 'workarounds'.	interviews discussed in methods section.	section and useful examples included. Coding process resulted in 47 'stories'.	Three tables are incorporated which: a) summarize workaround stories by context and respondent type; b) link examples of workarounds to policy directives; c) profile representative workaround stories	
23. Bryer 2009	PAR	Responsiveness to citizens in collaborative processes and how roles and responsibilities are defined in the governance process. Situated within literature on responsiveness in network governance. Programmatic positioning within authors' own work. Literature introduced upfront and in discussion.	Two case studies of collaborative learning processes. Data sources made explicit. These included interviews, open-ended e-mail questions and participant observation of learning and design forum sessions. Baseline interviews conducted in one case. Interview themes very briefly detailed and e-mail questions provided.	A narrative overview of the coding process is provided, suggesting an inductive orientation. This is supplemented with a table providing a quantitative summary of allocation to coding sub categories.	Combination of showing and telling. Narrative overview organized by theme with supporting quotes.	Administrator and citizen perceptions of their own and the other party's roles may influence the quality of responsive behavior in collaborative activity. Identifies contingencies that may allow administrators to be more responsive to citizens in collaborative processes.
24. Durose 2009	PA	Explores everyday work of frontline employees in contemporary local governance. Situated in literature on networked governance and neighborhoods.	Single case interpretive ethnographic research design. Interview data collected from 45 participants in two stages between 2005 and 2006 and supplemented with informal meetings and	Inductive narrative approach to analysis, focused on 'stories'. Identified as interpretive approach and described in detail over four paragraphs in methods section.	Combination of telling and showing. Author provides a very rich account, supplemented with numerous extracts from interviews.	Provides insight into 'readings' that front-line workers make which enable them to align policy demands and community needs within the context of local governance.

			attendance at events. Interview themes provided.	Analytic and validation process detailed, but codes not provided.		
25. Moynihan 2009	JPART	Focuses on application of a structural innovation known as Incident Command Systems (ICS) in different crisis scenarios. Applies network governance response, and network theory, to understand how responses to crises inform network coordination and effectiveness.	Comparative case analysis with crises as the unit of analysis. Detailed discussion of case sampling explicated. Reader referred to other publications for detail regarding data sources, but requirement for multiple in-depth data sources part of case selection.	Inductive and deductive analytic approach. The rationale for focusing on three concepts that emerged as particularly important – network diversity, shared authority and trust – is clearly stated. Content analysis articulated in a transparent and systematic way.	Predominance of telling with some showing based on excerpts of text. A rich account is provided. Table provided which summarizes comparative analysis against the three concepts by case.	Highlights implications for crisis response and for theories of network governance. Sheds light on network effectiveness, relative to a specific emergency management intervention.
26. Hendriks 2008	PA	Explores network governance from the perspective of inclusion and democracy. Situated relative to literature on inclusion and network governance.	Single case study approach drawing on 27 interviews conducted in 2006 as well as policy documents and media reports. Data collection processes are briefly discussed in the methods section. A list of interviewees is provided in an appendix. Broad interview themes succinctly outlined.	Less detail is provided on the analytic approach.	Predominance of telling supplemented by some showing. The author provides a detailed account of the case study. In providing the account, the author makes reference to specific interviewees by referring to the list in the appendix. Reference is also made to secondary sources.	Highlights problems with emphasis on entrepreneurial rather than democratic focus of networks. Also emphasizes the capacity required for networks to work effectively alongside existing political institutions.

27. Moynihan 2008	GOV	Examines potential for 'interorganizational hierarchies' - combinations of hierarchy and network organization used as policy instruments. Located in discussions of hierarchy and network forms of governance.	Single case study approach focused on incident command system (ICS). Detailed methods section provides justification for single case approach and details three data sources: After action review based on 75 interviews, 6 focus groups and a survey of taskforce participants; External review report; 13 managerial interviews. Interview themes are not detailed.	Author adopts a combined inductive-deductive approach. The analysis is presented thematically but the emergence of these codes is implicit.	Combination of telling and showing. Author provides a highly detailed account of the case and the context of crisis. Findings are presented in summary narrative form, supplemented with illustrative quotations. Findings lead to generation of five propositions.	Analysis highlights that the success of ICS (hierarchically coordinated interorganizational network) was contingent upon management variables – such as interorganizational trust – and crisis characteristics.
28. Keast et al. 2007.	IPMJ	Explores cooperation, coordination and collaboration forms of horizontal integration. Situated in service integration literature and draws on inter-organization theory.	Comparative case study approach based on five cases. Data derived from 40 interviews, plus focus groups. Interview schedule provided to indicate themes.	Both deductive and inductive aspects evident. Analysis of comparative cases undertaken to progressively focus upon themes of interest. Software package employed to undertake thematic coding. Detail of coding process provided but analysis and themes not fully exhibited.	Combination of telling and extensive showing. Considerable primary data shown in form of quotations.	International and jurisdictional convergence observed. Three C's (cooperation, coordination and collaboration) identified as complementary and not competitive mechanisms. Need for a framework to guide action and provide legitimacy for working differently

29. Martin 2007.	IPMJ	Evaluates success of task forces typically found in conflict and transitions scenarios. Draws on public management, organization studies and development studies to elaborate 'development by committee' perspective.	Comparative case study analysis based on four cases. Longitudinal research over six-year period. Data drawn from 182 in-depth interviews across thirty organizations, plus additional meeting observations. Some repeat interviews conducted (number unspecified). Interview themes not provided.	Less detail provided on analytic approach and data analysis.	Combination of showing and telling. A narrative account of each case is provided, with illustrative quotations interwoven.	Extends understanding of interorganizational relationship forms, specifically which best suit different phases of development for states in conflict. Highlights importance of context, strategy, management and organization in shaping fit with interorganizational form.
30. Keast et al. 2004.	PAR	Focuses on the complexities of developing a network structure. Located within literature on network structures.	Case analysis focused on a single network structure. Interview, focus group and document data gathered between 2001-2002. Less detail on precise number of interviewees and documents analysed. Extensive background to case provided. Subject content of interviews and focus group not explicitly discussed.	Less detail is provided on analytic approach and processes provided.	Combination of telling and showing. Narrative overview of network structure in development with a selection of supporting quotation.	Highlights that innovative network structures remain at odds with traditional mechanisms for delivering and assessing processes and outcomes.
31. Bate 2000	PA	Study of organizational culture change during shift from a hierarchical to collaborative networked community. Atypical as consistent	Ethnographic and action research approaches combined and presented in outline form in a diagram. Data gathered over a two-year period – 150 visits, 500 research days, 100 interview	Inductive and thematic analysis of data. Clear discussion of broad approach to managing data; little detail and explanation of coding processes is	Combination of telling and extensive showing. The majority of the article is devoted to a very rich account of the organization. This account is	Profiles and conceptualises problems of coordination, accountability and change. Identifies that the potential of network structures can only be realised if there are equivalent shifts in culture, relationships

		with pure grounded theory approach, literature is not presented upfront.	participants. Interview content and participants discussed in brief in a paragraph in research methods section.	presented.	interspersed with numerous direct interview quotations. Key themes emerging from the data are conveyed in figure form.	and skills. This can only be achieved on an interactive basis.

* PMR, *Public Management Review*, PA, *Public Administration*, PAR *Public Administration Review*, JPART, *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, GOV *Governance*, IPMJ, *International Public Management Journal*.