



Longitudinal Impact of Welsh Clinical Leadership Fellowship

Journal:	<i>Leadership in Health Services</i>
Manuscript ID	LHS-06-2019-0033.R1
Manuscript Type:	Original Article
Keywords:	Clinical Leadership, Evaluation, Health leadership competencies

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Title: Longitudinal Impact of Welsh Clinical Leadership Fellowship

Abstract

Purpose: To evaluate the longer-term impact of the 12-month Welsh Clinical Leadership Fellowship.

Design/methodology/approach: Semi-structured interviews with ten out of 14 trainee doctors who were fellows between 2013-2016, exploring how leadership knowledge and skills were used in clinical practice, impact on patient care, and influence on careers. Data, ~~were~~ gathered in 2017, when participants had completed the Fellowship between one-three years ago, ~~were analysed thematically~~.

Findings: All found the Fellowship rewarding. The experience was felt to advantage them in consultant interviews. They gained insight into the wider influences on organisations and the complexity of issues facing senior clinicians. Although subtle, impact was significant, equipping fellows with negotiation skills, enabling them to better influence change. Indirect impact on clinical practice was evidenced by enhanced confidence, teamworking skills and progression of improvement projects. However, use of skills was limited by lack of seniority within teams, demands of medical training and examinations. The negativity of others towards management and leadership was also noted by some.

Research limitations/implications: Small participant numbers limit generalisability.

Practical implications: The Fellowship is designed to equip participants with skills to lead improvements in healthcare delivery. Those more advanced in their medical training had greater opportunity and seniority to lead change and were better placed to apply the learning. This has implications to whom the training should be targeted.

Originality/value: A rare study exploring the longer-term impact of a leadership programme on later clinical practice which adds to the body of knowledge of impact and efficacy of leadership training programmes in healthcare environments.

Keywords Clinical Leadership, Evaluation, Wales

Paper type Research paper

Leadership in Health Services

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Background and Purpose

The importance of medical leadership and management in the complex organisation that is the National Health Service (NHS) has been advocated in the literature (Griffiths, 1983; Darzi, 2008; Francis, 2013). The General Medical Council guidelines outline the wider management and leadership responsibilities of doctors within the workplace (GMC, 2012). Exercising these responsibilities depends on seniority of role within an organisation, notwithstanding the primary duty of all doctors which is “the care and safety of patients” (GMC, 2012). Over the last decade or so, a variety of training programmes have been set up in the UK to overcome the low level of engagement, as noted by Bohmer (2012), of doctors in leadership and management (Darzi, 2008). These include the National Medical Director’s Clinical Fellow Scheme; Yorkshire and Humber Improvement Academy Clinical Leadership Training Programme; Scottish Clinical Leadership Fellowship; Northern Ireland Medical and Dental Leadership Fellows’ programme; as well as the Welsh Clinical Leadership Training Fellowship. Although eligibility criteria and the content of programmes differ, in essence their aim is to provide trainee doctors with the skills and theoretical knowledge to undertake leadership and management roles in their future careers.

Set up in 2013, the Welsh Clinical Leadership Training Fellowship (WCLT) is a 12-month programme representing a collaboration between Health Education and Improvement Wales (HEIW) (formerly the Wales Deanery), Academi Wales, Welsh Government and NHS Wales. The aim of the Fellowship is to provide doctors and dentists with opportunities to enhance skills, knowledge and understanding of healthcare management, leadership and policy and to develop clinical managers capable of building and leading improvements in healthcare delivery in the NHS.

The WCLT is open to trainee doctors and dentists undertaking core or higher specialty training. As part of the programme, fellows undertake a leadership project, under supervision, within their host organisation, which is typically health boards. Projects are identified by the host organisations and focus on improving services for patients. They are designed to enable fellows to apply to practice the principles of leadership and management which they explore within the training modules. Fellows are encouraged to engage with other host-based opportunities, including attending meetings and working with multi-professional teams.

1
2
3
4 During the year, fellows attend a structured leadership training programme run by Academi
5 Wales, which provides opportunities to network with and learn from senior medical
6 colleagues across Welsh health organisations. Although the majority of their week is spent
7 on the service improvement project, fellows are allowed to continue with clinical duties for up
8 to a maximum of 20% of their time.
9

10
11
12 The literature identifies many different models of leadership and leadership training, most of
13 which comprise similar core competencies. The CanMEDS (Canadian Medical Education
14 Directions for Specialists) Framework (Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of
15 Canada, 2005; Viches *et al*, 2016) outlines seven roles which are fulfilled by medical
16 experts. One of the roles is 'leader' which entails responsibility for the ongoing operation and
17 improvement of the healthcare system; contribution to administration, teaching and
18 scholarship; efficient use of resources; and improving practice at personal, team,
19 organisation and system levels. This framework has been widely adopted. For example, both
20 the Royal Australian College of Medical Administrators (RACMA) medical leadership and
21 management curriculum and the Danish Health and Medicines Authority (2014) are
22 organised around the CanMEDS framework.
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34

35 In the UK, the NHS Leadership Qualities Framework (LQF) (2003) model comprises fifteen
36 qualities, arranged in three clusters: personal qualities; setting direction; and delivering the
37 service. This model is a general framework aimed at all staff in the health service. Similarly
38 in the UK, the Medical Leadership Competency Framework (MLCF) model (2010), as
39 designed by the NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement and The Academy of Medical
40 Royal Colleges, is specifically aimed at doctors and has five domains: demonstrating
41 personal qualities; working with others; managing services; improving services; setting
42 direction
43
44
45
46
47
48

49 The Academi Wales leadership programme was informed by the MLCF (2010) (Table 1) and
50 designed to develop or enhance leadership skills, competencies and behaviours for medical
51 leaders of the future.
52
53

54 Table 1: How the Academi Wales Leadership Programme relates to the Medical Leadership Competency
55 Framework
56

Academi Wales Medical Leadership Programme	Medical Leadership Competency Framework (MLCF)
--	--

Self-awareness	Personal qualities
Effective management and leadership of people and resources	Working with others Managing services
Delivery of service innovation	Improving services
Strategies for improved effectiveness	Setting direction

The competencies of the WCLF programme, achieved through service improvement projects and the academic programme, are designed to: support and achieve organisational objectives through effective management and leadership of people and resources; positively impact on patients through support and delivery of service innovation; increase self-awareness and understanding of personal impact on situations and provide strategies for improved effectiveness. The projects are a key part of the programme, and as noted by Ten Cate et al (2010), competence means not only knowledge and skills but also their application. The projects provide opportunity to further develop and apply leadership skills.

We have reported our earlier evaluation of the programme, drawing on data collected during the course of the programme (Phillips and Bullock, 2018). Effective evaluation needs to be part of the overall development strategy (Phillips and Phillips, 2001) and only a small proportion of evaluation programmes have assessed long-term impact (Kellogg Foundation, 2002). The aim of this study, therefore, was to evaluate the longer-term impact of the WCLF on the work of former Fellows: how, and in what ways, do fellows use the knowledge and skills acquired during the Fellowship year within their clinical practice; what impact, if any, did the programme have on fellows' clinical practice and patient care; and what was the influence of the Fellowship on careers?

Method

We adopted a qualitative, interview-based longitudinal approach focused on the first three cohorts of the WCLF programme. A total of 14 fellows undertook the programme from its inception in August 2013 to those who completed the Fellowship year in July 2016.

An initial email was sent to all fourteen prospective participants, and follow-up emails sent to non-responders, inviting them to take part in a semi-structured interview by telephone or face-to-face according to their preference. Ethical approval for the study was granted (28

February 2017) by the research ethics committee of Postgraduate Medical and Dental Education at Cardiff University. For the purpose of the study, all fellows' names were anonymised. We include reference to the year in which participants undertook the WCLF programme such that C1 is cohort 1 (2013-14), C2 cohort 2 (2014-15) and C3 cohort 3 (2015-16).

Interviews were recorded, transcribed and anonymised. We adopted a thematic approach to the analysis of the data (Ritchie & Spencer, 1993). We followed the well-used six-step approach to thematic analysis described by Braun and Clarke (2006). This began with a process of data familiarisation through checking transcription accuracy and reading and re-reading the transcripts. One author (SP) coded the data manually (using highlighters and margin notes). The assignment of codes to themes was finalised through and a process of independent mapping whereby each author grouped the codes and discussed and agreed the outcomes. The grouping of the codes into themes broadly identifying common themes aligned to our three objectives: (1) use of the leadership knowledge and skills acquired during the Fellowship year within current clinical practice (key codes included transferable learning from the project, application of knowledge about leadership and change management, use of insights about personalities and teamworking, and value of wider insights into organisational systems – governance, finance, resources, priorities); (2) (indirect) impact on clinical practice and patient care (key codes included personal development - greater confidence, leadership, resilience, and quality improvement work); and (3) influence on career developments (key codes included preparation for applications and interviews, career planning, and opinions on what is the best career point to undertake the fellowship). We grouped a further set of codes (including time to use skills, demands of training, lack of seniority, limited leadership opportunities, and colleagues' negativity) under the theme The analysis also revealed barriers to impact.

Results

Ten (out of 14) former fellows agreed to take part in the study: nine interviews were conducted by telephone and one face-to-face. Table 2 shows the distribution of study participants by cohort. We note that there were more non-participants from cohort 1 than from the other two cohorts.

Table 2: Participants

Cohort	Number of Fellows in Cohort	Number of Fellows in study	Response rate
Cohort 1 (2013-14)	4	2	50%
Cohort 2 (2014-15)	4	3	75%
Cohort 3 (2015-16)	6	5	83%
Total Fellows	14	10	71%

On completion of the Fellowship, all fellows continued training, re-entering at points ranging from CT2/ST2 (Core Training year 2/Specialty Training year 2) to ST7 (Specialty Training year 7). Some fellows were near completion of specialty training when their Fellowship year ended, and at the time of interview, two had been appointed as consultants. Of the four non-participants, it was not possible to establish the stage of training they had reached or where they were currently based.

Use of leadership knowledge and skills within current clinical practice

All projects focussed on improving services for patients and were designed to enable fellows to apply the principles of leadership and management to practice. The projects were diverse. In cohort 1, for example, one project focused on the integration of emergency services in one town, across primary, community and secondary care. The fellow worked with a project board to develop the plan and provided clinical leadership for project implementation and the evaluation of quality improvement within the health service. In an example from cohort 2, one project concerned the integration of health and social care of older people with complex needs. This required the fellow to liaise with general practitioners (GPs), the health board and third sector organisations to use data from various sources to identify those at greater risk. One project from cohort 3 involved the fellow in the development of a new service which engaged the fellow in developing patient pathways and resolving problems, supported by clinical directors of theatres and critical care.

Daya (C3) stated his main learning experience had come from the project:

Not so much the content of what we were doing, but how to actually get the project going and how to sustain it. (Daya, C3)

Fellows did not necessarily select projects within their own specialty; six fellows chose projects outside of their training specialty. For example, a General Practice trainee undertook a surgical services project; the project for a trainee in plastic surgery was

1
2
3 concerned with care services for the elderly. Gwen (C1), who undertook a project within her
4 specialty, noted that all skills learned during the Fellowship year were, in her opinion,
5 “*completely transferable*”.
6
7

8
9 The Fellowship provided an insight into the influence of government and politics and the
10 implications of financial constraints and pressures on the NHS, and opportunities to shadow
11 Medical and Clinical directors as well as the Welsh Health Minister augmented this
12 knowledge. It also afforded fellows a greater understanding of where their individual
13 specialties sat within the wider scope of the NHS. It equipped them with an awareness of
14 wider and more complex issues faced by senior clinicians, leading one fellow (Emlyn, C2) to
15 appreciate that it was “*unrealistic*” to think problems could be solved merely by getting more
16 people and money, rather the importance of focussing on “*how we can change what we do*”.
17
18
19
20
21
22

23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
60
Fellows thought that the experience of the projects and these wider insights had influenced
their current practice, although the impact was subtle rather than obvious. Morgan (C2), for
example, commented that the knowledge of management and leadership had given him a
greater appreciation of “*behind-the-scenes systems*” and that this knowledge was “*useful*”.
He stated that he had learned:

...how the leadership structure in hospitals work, how that looks organisationally and
how it functions and useful to know who those people are and what they do if I want
to effect any change. (Morgan ,C2)

Fellows learned that successful implementation of change was facilitated by knowing
structures and systems, fitting with organisational priorities and gaining the support of key
players.

Emlyn (C2) recognised the importance of knowing Health Board priorities and challenges
and ensuring any proposed changes matched such priorities, “*then people are much more
likely to listen*”. Fellows used this knowledge in their quality improvement work: it helped
them to identify key healthcare improvement issues and aided discussion about projects and
where to find information.

Fellows reported the academic work on personality traits and teamworking as particularly
useful, providing methods to approach problems, ways to interact with difficult colleagues
and negotiate solutions. Eight fellows reported that the Fellowship had enhanced their team-
working skills and had improved their people skills. For example, as a result of the

1
2
3 Fellowship, Bryn (C1) had developed a better understanding of how people think and act
4 and how to negotiate with people within a team:
5
6

7 *We did a lot of work on personality traits and type of teamwork. I understand now*
8 *why they think and act the way they do. So that's been extremely useful from a*
9 *clinical [team] point of view. (Bryn, C1)*
10
11

12 He noted that having such an understanding of people “*definitely*” impacted on his own
13 behaviour, in engaging with people, who in the past, he would not have got on with “*because*
14 *I just got frustrated with them*”.
15
16
17

18 Daya (C3) reported spending time with team members on a “*one-to-one*” basis, to get
19 everyone on side to achieve goals; and the knowledge of personality types and team
20 dynamics had improved Amadi’s (C3) confidence in leading a team and his ability to get
21 more out of team members. Some of the techniques learned had become embedded into
22 practice as revealed by the following comments:
23
24
25
26

27 *I think I'm actually subconsciously using some of the techniques, and I'm not even*
28 *aware that I'm doing it. (Amadi, C3)*
29
30

31 *It's in my head now. You can't take that out. (Daya, C3)*
32
33

34 Although the Fellowship had not changed her day-to-day interaction with patients, Gwen
35 (C1) acknowledged that it had modified the way she interacted with hospital staff. She
36 tended to be a little less tolerant of excuses and was:
37
38
39

40 *... a bit more willing to question people these days than I would have been before I*
41 *did it [the Fellowship]. Get people to look for solutions rather than necessarily just*
42 *complaining about problems. (Gwen, C1)*
43
44

45 Vivian (C3) reflected that the Fellowship had armed her with new skills and new ways to deal
46 with problems and how to “*interact with difficult colleagues*”. She reported making better use
47 of team members by delegating tasks that she did not like to those who did. She made
48 specific reference to how teamworking skills had become embedded:
49
50
51

52 *...you do learn without realising and it's often only later that you realise how much*
53 *you learnt.... The Fellowship has shaped who I am now, given me more awareness*
54 *of who I am, my role within a team ... All I've learned is now embedded, it's just*
55 *always there and that's who I am now post-Fellowship. (Vivian, C3)*
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4 Lindsay (C3) felt the Fellowship had given her the *“the ability to look at the world through*
5 *new eyes”*. There were both positive and negative aspects to this new view of the world. As
6
7 someone who had always been keen to make changes and get involved, positive aspects
8
9 gave her *“the knowledge and bravery to actually get involved”*. On the negative side,
10
11 however, she was cognisant that although keen and enthusiastic, she could not make all the
12
13 changes she would like to or tell people what she thought they were doing badly. Her
14
15 strategy was, therefore, *“to be positive and negotiate with people”*.

16
17 Skills learnt in terms of how to negotiate and write proposals, enhanced fellows' ability to put
18
19 forward business cases for new patient services in the future and four fellows reported that
20
21 their continued contact with HEIW had led to: writing papers for publication; participating in
22
23 and leading sessions on leadership; organising training days. At interview, Vivian (C3)
24
25 reported that she had become a member of the Quality Improvement Skills Training (QIST)
26
27 steering group at HEIW.

28
29 The fellows reported varied continued involvement with projects. Four fellows had had no
30
31 further involvement in the projects. Although Parker (C3) would have liked to continue
32
33 working on some aspects of the project, there just was not sufficient time:

34
35 *It's time pressure...It's not that the will isn't there. There is just a physical limit to how*
36
37 *much stuff you can get out of a week. (Parker, C3)*

38
39 Morgan (C2) had left Wales and therefore had no further contact with his project. However,
40
41 he reported that he had been able to transfer the skills learned during the Fellowship on
42
43 workforce planning to his new Trust. Emlyn (C2) had moved health boards, so had no
44
45 further involvement with the project, but he too reported transferring some of the ideas and
46
47 skills learned.

48 Impact on clinical practice and patient care

49
50 Although fellows found it hard to identify the *direct* impact on their practice and patient care,
51
52 some of them reported use of the knowledge and skills of leadership and teamworking as
53
54 described above, had *indirect* impact. Part of this indirect impact was revealed in how the
55
56 doctors talked about their personal development. Emlyn (C2), Amadi (C3), Gwen (C1) and
57
58 Francis (C2) stated that the Fellowship had taught them a lot about themselves. Since
59
60 undertaking the Fellowship, Emlyn (C2) reported that he felt *“more confident”* in his role as a

1
2
3 consultant; Amadi (C3) noted the WCLF had given him an understanding of team dynamics
4 and he now felt *“more confident in leading a team”*. Gwen (C1) commented:

5
6
7 *I think it's made me a bit more resilient and also given me a few more coping*
8 *strategies when things don't actually work the way I wanted them to. (Gwen, C1)*
9

10
11 Our suggestion here is that such insights and strategies equipped the doctors with skills and
12 attitudes that enabled them to perform better in their clinical practice, to the benefit of patient
13 care. A little more directly, Daya (C3) commented that prior to the Fellowship he had not
14 taken a very *“methodical approach”* in recognising areas that he could improve. It therefore
15 helped him to identify:

16
17
18 *the important aspects of the day-to-day role of the team I work in that should be*
19 *focused on improving care. (Daya, C3)*
20

21
22 On their return to clinical training, both Bryn (C1) and Francis (C2) had opportunities to take
23 part in and supervise quality improvement projects. Emlyn (C2) reported having taken on the
24 lead for a quality improvement project that involved:

25
26
27 *setting up and running a quality improvement group within our paediatric department*
28 *multidisciplinary group. (Emlyn, C2)*
29

30 31 32 Influence on career development

33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

Both Emlyn (C2) and Gwen (C1) thought that the knowledge of leadership and management gained during their Fellowship had prepared them for consultant interviews and the questions about management. As Emlyn (C2) stated:

52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

1
2
3
4 He further declared that the knowledge enabled him to answer questions at interview, which
5 some of his colleagues had found challenging, and he was able to use his Fellowship
6 experience to exemplify his answers. Gwen (C1) added that the skills she had developed
7 during the Fellowship had made her *“very sellable in terms of actually what I can give as a*
8 *consultant”*. In a similar fashion, Morgan (C2) noted that the Fellowship provided something
9 extra to offer at consultant level interviews. Observing and shadowing senior management
10 provided an insight into the challenges they face, and what being a Clinical or Medical
11 Director actually involved on a day-to-day basis. For Amadi (C3) observing the work of his
12 Clinical Director had proved *“valuable in terms of my own career planning and future career”*.
13
14 Although at different stages of training and seniority, nine of the former Fellows personally
15 felt they had undertaken the Fellowship at the *“right point”* in their careers.
16
17

18
19 Although Parker (C3) and Lindsay (C3) were juniors and undertook the Fellowship before
20 going into specialty training programmes, neither felt this had been a disadvantage. Lindsay
21 (C3) was not of the opinion leadership training should be restricted to later in a career
22 pathway. Lindsay (C3) stated that in her clinical role:
23
24

25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
*People look to me for leadership. There’s a lot of opportunities. And the idea that I’m
not senior enough to learn about leadership is a bit of nonsense really. (Lindsay, C3)*

Amadi (C3) stated he could have done the Fellowship at any other point in his training, but
having done one year of the specialty training programme felt:

*It was the right time to have that year away from the clinical setting. Kind of reset the
clock. Learn some new skills and then use those when I go back to clinical. (Amadi,
C3)*

Morgan (C2) felt the fellowship afforded *“a little bit of breathing space”* from the
standardisation of clinical training, and provide time to reflect on his future career pathway.
However, Emlyn’s (C2) comment also recognises that leadership development is not just
about innate qualities: it requires hard work too:

*... it really depends on how you work as a person. It’s not an easy year...It’s hard
work, and it’s not just a year off. (Emlyn, C2)*

1
2
3
4 Former Fellows' responses suggest that the best time for a trainee to undertake the
5 Fellowship comes down to a personal sense of when the time is right. As Parker (C3)
6 succinctly put it:
7

8
9 *The number [year of training] is not an indictment of competence. (Parker, C3)*
10
11

12 13 Barriers to impact

14 In this section we consider barriers to impact as raised by the fellows we interviewed. Time
15 to use skills was a significant factor. On returning to clinical practice, fellows' time in their
16 respective training programmes varied, thus it is difficult to generalise about the
17 opportunities to apply the skills acquired during the fellowship year.
18
19

20
21 Although there were differences in opinion as to the best stage of training for undertaking the
22 Fellowship, seven former Fellows acknowledged that the personality of the individual trainee
23 was an important factor. Having said that, there was some evidence to suggest that the
24 career stage of the Fellow could impede the use of the leadership skills. Although most
25 (nine fellows), judged that it had been the right time in their career path to undertake the
26 Fellowship, there were examples where their more junior positions lessened the scope for
27 them to use their leadership skills. Morgan (C2), for example, felt that on reflection, "*I don't*
28 *think it was the perfect time for me*". He felt his lack of experience had held him back
29 somewhat, and perhaps he should have waited until further into training and had built up
30 credibility: "*I was so very junior, between FT1 and FT2*". Gwen (C1) further commented that
31 at Foundation level, others' expectations may limit the impact of the Fellows:
32
33

34
35 *You're too junior to almost have an opinion which is nonsense, but that unfortunately*
36 *is the way that people will look at you from the outside. (Gwen, C1)*
37
38

39
40 Although Daya (C3) accepted that there could be benefits of doing the Fellowship at an early
41 stage in training, being a long way off a consultant role provided little "*time dedicated to work*
42 *on improvements and management type activity*". Personally, therefore, he felt it should be
43 undertaken when "*you're established on your clinical training path*". (Daya, C3). Bryn (C1)
44 commented "*if you don't use your skills, they get lost very quickly*" and noted that only
45 consultants were able to undertake certain functions. Post-Fellowship, therefore, fellows
46 were limited in the leadership roles they were able to undertake. Both Parker (C3) and Daya
47 (C3) concurred that leadership is not considered part of clinical training programmes.
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 One of the major hurdles to making improvements and implementing change, were the
4 challenges and resistance of medical colleagues and Emlyn (C2) understood why people
5 “get exhausted” trying. Gwen (C1) admitted that there were still some people whom she
6 would hesitate to tell she had done the Fellowship, because the attitude would be “oh you
7 want to be a manager”. She felt that they looked down at her for having an interest in
8 management or leadership and felt the need to make excuses for having done the
9 programme. Bryn (C1) concurred that the attitude of going over to the ‘dark side’ (Hayden,
10 2017; Loh *et al*, 2016) still prevailed among some senior staff in spite of an increase in
11 medical leadership posts and involvement in quality improvement. However, he felt that the
12 creation of more medical leadership programmes and posts in the UK had improved the
13 attitude of seniors somewhat.

23 Discussion

24 This is a small-scale study and not all of the former fellows agreed to take part. We are thus
25 wary of extending the conclusions beyond the confines of this sample. It is difficult to
26 generalise the impact of the Fellowship as all the cases were unique. There was variation in
27 terms of what stage they were at when they did the Fellowship, the time since completion of
28 the programme, and how their careers had progressed. That said, our findings serve to
29 highlight the value of the Fellowship programme and provide specific examples of how
30 former fellows’ current practice benefits from the skills they developed. Certainly for those
31 former fellows who had proceeded to consultant level, a knowledge of leadership within the
32 NHS had proved immensely useful at interview. It had made the interview process more
33 straightforward and helped them to secure consultant posts.

34 Some individuals naturally possess the personal qualities and characteristics necessary for
35 leadership (Northouse, 2018), but as well as such ‘innate’ qualities, fellows recognised that
36 the fellowship year required hard work. In general, the more junior fellows did not feel at a
37 disadvantage at undertaking the fellowship at such an early stage of their careers and
38 success was, in part, dependent on the fellows themselves. However, opportunities to apply
39 the skills learned during the fellowship year varied. The Fellowship is designed to equip
40 participants with skills to lead improvements in healthcare delivery. Those more advanced in
41 their medical training had greater opportunity and seniority to lead change and were better
42 placed to apply the learning. This has implications for whom the training should be targeted.

43 It is notable that the Scottish Clinical Leadership Fellowship (www.scotlanddeanery.nhs.scot)

1
2
3 restricts entry to trainees at CT2/ST2 (Core Training 2/Specialty Training 2) or above, and
4 the Northern Ireland Clinical Leadership Fellowship programme (www.nimdtg.gov.uk/adept/)
5 which restricts entry to ST4, or ST3 for GP and Dental trainees.
6
7

8
9 A constraint on using their leadership skills was the reported perception of the culture in the
10 NHS. Both hierarchy, whereby only consultants can undertake certain leadership activities,
11 and a dismissive attitude to those showing an interest in leadership, limited trainees'
12 involvement in leadership activities and their contribution to the implementation of change
13 and improvements for the benefit of patients.
14
15

16
17 Although direct impact on clinical practice and patient care was difficult to identify, indirect
18 impact was evident through personal development, in gaining confidence in leading teams
19 and a greater awareness of their role within a larger organisation. Such insights and
20 strategies enhanced performance in clinical practice, which could benefit patient care. One
21 of the more useful aspects of the fellowship was gaining an understanding of teamworking.
22 Learning about teamworking was of particular value when they returned to clinical practice,
23 enhancing how former fellows interacted with their teams. Not only did the Fellowship
24 provide techniques to interact with difficult colleagues and negotiate solutions, it also
25 impacted on fellows' own behaviour towards colleagues within the clinical setting. Their
26 confidence within the team setting improved, and delegation skills were also enhanced.
27 Such knowledge had become embedded into practice and used subconsciously.
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40

41 Conclusion

42
43 [This study has revealed some of the longer-term impacts of the clinical leadership fellowship](#)
44 [in Wales.](#) A knowledge of how management and leadership functions within the NHS
45 provided a greater understanding of the complex issues faced by senior clinicians. Through
46 teamworking and continuing projects focussed on improving patient care fellows were able
47 to identify the indirect impact of the Fellowship on patient care. Notwithstanding the transient
48 nature of teams within the health service where establishing relationships could be
49 somewhat challenging, a greater understanding of team dynamics had increased fellows'
50 confidence in both managing and leading teams. However, on returning to clinical practice,
51 fellows were at different levels within their specialty training, so it was not always feasible to
52 transfer and use the leadership skills learned. Concentrating on completing clinical training
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

was a priority for the fellows at the end of the WCLF. This limited the time, opportunity or capacity to participate in on-going leadership activities.

Arising from our findings we suggest that further consideration might be given to whether applicants for the fellowship should have attained a minimum stage in their career, whether the fellowship programme should include a structured assessment of competencies and whether there is a need to further support trainees on return to the workplace with continued leadership opportunities. We have noted the difficulty of demonstrating impact on patient care. Although challenging, further research might include measures of patient outcomes and cost of care, for example. Perhaps more realistically, we also suggest that insight into the impact on patient care might be gained from analysing feedback from stakeholders in the leadership project the fellows undertake.

~~This longitudinal study of the WCLT adds to the body of knowledge of the impact and efficacy of leadership training programmes.~~

References

Academy of Medical Royal Colleges and NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement (2010). *Medical Leadership Competency Framework: Enhancing Engagement in Medical Leadership*. Third edition, NHS Institute of Innovation and Improvement, University of Warwick, Coventry.

Bohmer, R. (2012). *"The instrumental value of medical leadership", Engaging doctors in improving services*. Commissioned by The King's Fund, London.

Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, Vol 3, 77-101.

Danish Medical Association (2014). *The seven roles of physicians (Version 1, English)*. Danish Health and Medicines Authority, Copenhagen.

Darzi, A. (Lord of Denham) (2008). *High Quality Care for All: NHS Next Stage Review Final Report*, Department of Health, London.

Francis, R. (2013). *Report of the Mid Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust Public Enquiry*, The Stationery Office, London.

General Medical Council (2012). *Leadership and management for all doctors*. London, GMC.

- 1
2
3 Griffiths, R. (1983). *NHS Management Inquiry (the Griffiths Report)*, HMSO, London.
- 4
5
6 Ham, C. and Dickinson, H. (2008) *Engaging doctors in leadership: what can we learn from*
7 *international experience and research evidence?* Academy of Royal Colleges/University of
8 Birmingham/NHS Institute for Innovation & Improvement.
- 9
10
11 Hayden, J. (2017). Tomorrow's leaders – the role of leadership in medical education and
12 training, *Future Hospital Journal*, Vol.4(1), 49-50.
- 13
14
15 Health Care Innovation Unit and School of Management (2004) *Leadership Evaluation: An*
16 *Impact Evaluation of a Leadership Development Programme*. University of Southampton.
- 17
18
19 Kellogg Foundation (2002) *Evaluating Outcomes and Impacts: A Scan of 55 Leadership*
20 *Development Programs*. W.K. Kellogg Foundation, Battle Creek, MI.
- 21
22
23 Loh, E., Morris, J., Thomas, L., Bismark, M.M., Phelps, G. and Dickinson, H. (2016). Shining
24 the light on the dark side of medical leadership – a qualitative study in Australia. *Leadership*
25 *in Health Services*. 2016; Vol.29 (3):313-330.
- 26
27
28 NHS Leadership Centre (2003). *NHS Leadership Qualities Framework*, NHS Leadership
29 Centre, London.
- 30
31
32 Northern Ireland Clinical Leadership Programme. Available at:
33 <http://www.nimdtg.gov.uk/adept/> (accessed 12 June 2019)
- 34
35
36 Northouse, PG. (2018) *Introduction to Leadership: Concepts and Practice*. (4th edition).
37 Sage, London.
- 38
39
40 Phillips, P.P. and Phillips, J.J. (2001) Symposium on the Evaluation of Training. *International*
41 *Journal of Training and Development*. 2001; Vol.5 (4):240-247.
- 42
43
44 Phillips, S. and Bullock, A.D. (2018). Clinical leadership training: an evaluation of the Welsh
45 Fellowship Programme. *Leadership in Health Services*. 2018; 31:226-237.
- 46
47
48 Richie, J. and Spencer, L. (1993). *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science*
49 *Students and Researchers*. Sage Publications, London.
- 50
51
52 Royal Australian College of Medical Administrators (RACMA) (2017). Medical leadership
53 and management curriculum. Available at:
54 www.racma.edu.au/index.php?option=com_docman&task=view&gid=877 (accessed 5 June
55 2019).
- 56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4 Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada. CanMEDS. Available at
5 www.royalcollege.ca. (accessed 15 May 2019).
6

7
8 Scottish Clinical Leadership Fellowship Scheme. Available at:
9 [https://www.scotlanddeanery.nhs.scot/your-development/leadership-and-management-](https://www.scotlanddeanery.nhs.scot/your-development/leadership-and-management-development/scottish-clinical-leadership-fellowship-scheme/)
10 [development/scottish-clinical-leadership-fellowship-scheme/](https://www.scotlanddeanery.nhs.scot/your-development/leadership-and-management-development/scottish-clinical-leadership-fellowship-scheme/) (accessed 12 June 2019)
11
12

13 Ten Cate, O., Snell, L. and Carraccio, C. (2010). Medical competence: The interplay
14 between individual ability and the health care environment. *Medical Teacher*. 2010; 32:669-
15 665.
16
17

18
19 Viches, S., Fenwick, S., Harris, B., Lammi, B. and Racette, R. (2016). *Changing health*
20 *organizations with the LEADS leadership framework: Report of the 2014-2016 LEADS*
21 *impact study*. Ottawa, Canada: Fenwick Leadership Explorations, the Canadian College of
22 Health Leaders & the Centre for Health Leadership and Research, Royal Roads University.
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60