

Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository: <http://orca.cf.ac.uk/75241/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Evans, Claire and Stroud, Dean Allen 2016. Greening steel work: varieties of capitalism and the 'greening' of skills. *Journal of Education and Work* 29 (3) , pp. 263-283.
10.1080/13639080.2014.907487 file

Publishers page: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2014.907487>
<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2014.907487>>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies. See <http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.





Greening steel work: Varieties of Capitalism and the 'greening' of skills

Journal:	<i>Journal of Education and Work</i>
Manuscript ID:	CJEW-2013-0038.R1
Manuscript Type:	Research Article
Keywords:	Green Skills, Apprenticeship, Vocational Education, Political Economy

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Greening steel work: Varieties of capitalism and the ‘greening’ of skills

Introduction

The institutional contexts of nations vary widely and such diversity shapes Vocational Education and Training (VET) systems and frameworks, as well as the outcomes of workplace learning (see Bosch and Charest, 2008). The dominant institutions impact, moreover, upon the capacity of VET systems to respond and adapt to wider policy (and industrial) initiatives on skills and occupational development. A policy direction currently gaining impetus both globally and regionally is the green jobs and skills agenda. In Europe, this is being driven by the European Union’s (EU) aims of sustainable economic growth and the parallel cultivation of and transition to a low-carbon, resource-efficient economy (European Commission, 2010). This transition requires the ‘greening’ of extant occupations and competences, as well as the creation of appropriate skills within sectors and across occupations (CEDEFOP, 2010a).

For the EU’s goal of a green economy to be realised, the cultivation of appropriate ‘green’ skills – i.e. the knowledge, abilities, values and attitudes needed to develop and support a society that reduces the impact of human activity on the environment (Dierdorff et al, 2009) – is required. The specific pressure on VET systems is responding to the sustainability/green agenda and embedding the skills necessary for the ‘greening’ of work within training programmes. However, the extent to which member states have embraced environmental protection *per se*, and more specifically, endeavoured to ‘green’ jobs and skills, and VET provision, is variable (ECORYS, 2010). Institutional frameworks (including VET systems) and the way they are organised, provide the context within which firms might engage with the green agenda, particularly in relation to skills development at the member state level.

Drawing on case-study evidence from a project conducted on the European steel industry, this paper examines how, and to what extent, institutional contexts – specifically those in Germany and the UK – impact upon company-level environmental policy, training policies and practices, with a particular focus on apprenticeships. The steel industry constitutes an interesting focus for analysis, given the high impact of environmental policy on the industry. Furthermore, apprenticeship programmes are a particularly salient focus of study – such programmes traverse the boundaries of both external VET systems and internal

1
2
3 company processes, thereby facilitating examination of the intersection between institutional
4 contexts, sector and employer imperatives.
5
6

7
8 The green skills agenda requires enhanced apprenticeship provision and training at company
9 level. However, our argument is that firm-level policies and practices in these areas are
10 mostly determined by dominant institutional frameworks, including the organisation of VET
11 (see Bosch and Charest, 2008). Distinctive patterns of institutional variation mean that the
12 greening of the labour process (and company environmental policies) develops in different
13 ways in different places, with contrasting trajectories evident in Co-ordinated Market
14 Economies (CMEs) and Liberal Market Economies (LMEs) (Hall and Soskice, 2001).
15
16

17
18 Our evidence, in what follows, suggests that the implementation of change is much more
19 dynamic in the context of CMEs, such as Germany. Here, change is shaped by wider
20 processes of innovation on the environment, and cultivated by long-term, developmental
21 orientations encouraged by extant institutional configurations. Further, **such orientations are
22 compatible with, and conducive to, the implementation of sustainable development and
23 environmental protection policies at both macro and micro-economic levels (Lydenberg,
24 2009).** In contrast, in LMEs such as the UK, there are significant barriers to the vision for,
25 and investments in, the skills necessary for comprehensive greening of the labour process,
26 with an extant development paradigm that is driven by short-term benefits and a limited focus
27 on securing environmental compliance (Kemp and Loorbach, 2006; *Name deleted to
28 maintain the integrity of the review process*).
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42

43 **The European Steel Industry**

44 The European steel industry has transformed in recent decades, 'becoming increasingly
45 global in its activities' (*Name deleted to maintain the integrity of the review process*). It has
46 moreover, become progressively oriented towards diversified product portfolios and higher
47 value-added products, which entailed the modernisation of production, changes in work
48 organisation and an increased emphasis on technological innovation (ESTEP, 2010). These
49 factors, in conjunction with a shift from high labour-intensity, and an unprecedented situation
50 in terms of the age and skill profile of the European workforce, mean that questions of
51 workforce development have become increasingly significant (*Name deleted to maintain the
52 integrity of the review process*). More recent pressures on the industry are EU policy aims of
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 sustainable economic growth and the cultivation of a green economy, which necessitates both
4 technological innovation and more efficient ways of working – with clear workforce
5 development implications (European Commission, 2010).
6
7

8
9
10 The environmental protection and sustainability agenda presents particular challenges for the
11 industry because steel production is intensive in a number of ways (e.g. with regard to energy
12 and raw materials) with high carbon emissions. It also generates significant levels of waste,
13 some of it hazardous. Such challenges require addressing, as a matter of corporate social
14 responsibility (CSR), but also because environmental regulation, and sanctions for breaches,
15 is increasing in prominence. The industry has to comply with extensive environmental
16 legislation, much of which emanates from the EU. As steel producers are principal emitters,
17 the sector is also covered by the provisions of EU Emissions Trading System (ETS), despite
18 industry arguments that this policy is jeopardising production in Europe. However, whilst the
19 sector has pledged its commitment to sustainable steel production, meeting environmental
20 and economic challenges, and ‘greening’ the workforce in line with such processes (ESTEP,
21 2010), it is far from clear that the necessary workforce development structures are in place to
22 support the ‘greening’ of skills across the EU industry.
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33

34 **Liberal and Co-ordinated Market Economies: VET, Apprenticeships and Green Skills**

35 Hall and Soskice’s (2001) influential ‘Varieties of Capitalism’ (VoC) typology, which
36 distinguishes between LMEs and CMEs, identifies significant variations in the institutional
37 and cultural patterns specific to these types of capitalism. The different national systems
38 associated with these dichotomous types have entailed important divergence in the VET
39 systems, including the apprenticeship schemes, ‘embedded’ in these institutions (Bosch and
40 Charest, 2008).
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

48 ***Co-ordinated Market Economies***

49 Although markets and hierarchies are important in CMEs like Germany, such economies are
50 characterised by strong networks of social institutions that regulate economic action within
51 markets. Here, markets are ‘deeply embedded in an array of co-operative, redistributive and
52 regulatory institutions’ (Streeck, 1992: 6). **In Germany, these institutions include powerful
53 employer associations, strong trade unions, networks of cross-shareholding, as well as
54 regulatory systems that encourage collaboration (Hall and Soskice, 2001). Moreover, and of
55
56
57
58
59
60**

1
2
3 significance, the financial system is less market-based and firms raise capital on a long-term
4 basis through regionally based banks as opposed to the stock market (Tylecote and Conesa,
5 1999). Close links exist between lending banks and firms and this results in the provision of
6 'patient capital'. Such structuring of financial markets within CMEs plays a crucial role in
7 encouraging goals of sustainable development and environmental protection at the micro-
8 economic level, as firms are able to adopt longer-term, developmental orientations that focus
9 on future potentials as opposed to immediate earnings (Lydenberg, 2009).

10
11
12
13
14
15
16 Long-term orientations facilitate capital investment, technological innovation and strong
17 workforce skills development (Hall and Soskice, 2001). Indeed, the German 'skills' system
18 is renowned for high levels of industry-specific, engineering and technical skills, cultivated
19 within firms and in the wider VET system. Germany functions with a 'high-skill
20 equilibrium', where mutually reinforcing institutions encourage firms and workers to invest
21 in skill acquisition and development (Hall and Soskice, 2001). The costs of training are
22 shared – the state funds high quality vocational schools, whilst firms pay for all company-
23 provided training. Individuals contribute through, for instance, acceptance of low wages
24 whilst training as apprentices (Steedman, 2005). German VET programmes are perceived as
25 principal contributors to industrial competitiveness, given the quality of provision and the
26 responsiveness of the schemes to industrial innovations and changing employer demands for
27 skills (Bosch and Charest, 2008). Robust frameworks for incorporating such changes into
28 training provision and qualification structures exist, namely the institutions that support
29 sector dialogue between social partners (CEDEFOP, 2010b). The Federal Institute for VET
30 (Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung – BIBB), for example, works closely with the partners in
31 updating the training regulations that govern the curricula of formally-designated
32 occupations.
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45

46 The German 'dual-system' apprenticeship is established on this 'occupational model'
47 (Brockmann et al, 2010). As such, training is delivered as a coherent whole, comprised of
48 occupational knowledge and competences, as well as broader general and civic
49 education. The latter meets both social and economic goals through the cultivation of
50 cultural, social and identity capital, as well as citizenship behaviours in learners (Hoskins,
51 2008). Such outcomes have obvious significance for wider society, but also impact at the
52 organisational level. Performance is enhanced through the engendering of desirable conduct
53 at work i.e. organisational citizenship behaviours and the harnessing of the external, non-
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 market benefits of VET (e.g. Huang et al, 2012). Citizenship behaviours and the formation of
4 strong social/identity capital are of particular salience in considerations of environmental
5 protection, with organisational policy and practice inextricably linked to wider societal values
6 (Sagiv and Schwartz, 2007) and the associated configuration of the prevailing institutional
7 framework (Evans and Stroud, forthcoming).
8
9
10

11
12 Under the German system, training regulations exist for, and underpin, each of the recognised
13 occupations. These regulations govern compulsory subject material, which is incorporated
14 into the framework curricula pertaining to each occupation (Ryan and Unwin, 2001). The
15 training regulations also govern company training provision and thus, guarantee uniform
16 national standards across firms. There is not, however, an overarching state-driven green
17 skills policy, but occupational competences and training regulations have been greened – as
18 industrial sectors restructure and respond to extensive environmental legislation (CEDEFOP,
19 2010a). Environmental protection has been at the centre of public policy for decades, a
20 reflection of the strong environmental movement, the high environmental awareness of the
21 German polity, the political success of the Green Party, and the subsequent integration of
22 environmental issues into other parties' policies (Blühdorn, 2009). Further, environmental
23 policies have long been perceived as a source of innovation and a market opportunity for
24 domestic firms (CEDEFOP, 2010a). Environmental protection issues have been integrated
25 into all initial and continuing VET regulations through collaboration between BIBB and the
26 social partners – effectively greening the VET system (ibid.). This process of organic
27 collaboration stands in sharp contrast to the top-down attempts to drive this agenda in the
28 UK.
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42

43 *Liberal Market Economies*

44 Within LMEs such as the UK, the market is the dominant co-ordinator of economic action
45 (Hall and Soskice, 2001). Regulation focuses on ensuring that market forces prevail and this
46 encourages the formation of short-term, low trust relations both within and between
47 firms. Moreover, LMEs are organised around a stock market-based financial system, and
48 financial institutions in the UK offer capital to industry on the basis of high returns and short
49 payback targets (see Gospel and Pendleton, 2003); factors which have been identified as
50 inimical to longer-term goals of sustainable development (Lydenberg, 2009). The dominance
51 of shareholder values means that profits are generally not re-invested and go
52 disproportionately into dividend payments. Such demands, in conjunction with other
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 institutional factors (such as the predominance of low-wage, low-skill labour), combine to
4 produce an extant development paradigm that is ‘locked-in’ to trajectories driven by short-
5 term benefits (Kemp and Loorbach, 2006).
6
7

8
9
10 The LME model is seen as conducive to high risk processes of radical innovation, with a
11 focus on a fluid labour market, a reliance on general skills and the production of goods
12 requiring lesser skilled but lower cost labour (Hall and Soskice 2001:39). Consequently, at
13 firm level, there are significant implications for both technological investment and workforce
14 development – long-term projects with uncertain levels of return. The UK, in particular, has
15 been described as functioning with a ‘low skill, low pay, low productivity’ equilibrium (see
16 Keep et al, 2006), and ‘voluntarist’ market-based training systems mean that there is little
17 legal compulsion for employers to engage in skill enhancement. Similarly, weak regulation
18 of employment protection contributes to high levels of employee turnover, all of which
19 constitute systematic disincentives for workforce development (Lloyd and Payne, 2002).
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

28 In particular, whilst acknowledging that the devolved parts of the UK adopt different terms
29 for and approaches to apprenticeships, the UK has been more generally criticised for the poor
30 quality of provision, with vocational education generally perceived as being inferior to
31 academic pathways (*cf.* Bosch and Charest, 2008). There are two principal criticisms of
32 apprenticeships across the UK. First, as opposed to Germany, it has not been governed by
33 legislation until very recently and as such, there is a wide variation in provision, content and
34 duration across sectors and localities (Hogarth et al, 2012). Second, the reliance on the
35 National Vocational Qualification (NVQ) in England and Wales as the central form of
36 training and assessment has been widely condemned (Grugulis, 2003). NVQs conform to the
37 task-based qualification model, focusing on ‘narrow specialisation as opposed to
38 occupational capacity’ (Brockmann et al, 2010). This contrasts sharply with the emphasis on
39 imparting broader, underpinning theoretical knowledge found in the German occupational
40 model (Boreham, 2002).
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50

51 The Apprenticeships, Skills, Children and Learning Act (ASCL) of 2009 established a
52 statutory basis for apprenticeships and aimed to address some of the deficiencies of the
53 system through the creation of minimum standards in England and Wales. For example,
54 apprenticeships must now include a minimum of 280 ‘guided learning hours’. Delivered at a
55 minimum of two hours per week off-the-job, this is low compared to many European
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 countries where apprentices study for at least one day per week (often two in Germany) in a
4 vocational college, in addition to on-the-job training. Indeed, there is no minimum duration
5 for apprenticeships in England and Wales, with the decision left largely to the individual
6 employer – on average an apprenticeship is completed in one year, compared to an average of
7 three to four years in German-speaking countries (see Fuller and Unwin, 2012; Steedman,
8 2010). There is moreover, a lack of elaboration as to the content of apprenticeship, in contrast
9 to the German context where the proportions which will be devoted to general education and
10 vocational subjects are specified in detail. The UK system has yet to remedy the deficit in
11 intermediate-level (Level 3) and technical skills in the UK, with a large number of
12 apprenticeships undertaken at the basic/foundation level (Brockmann et al, 2008; Dolphin
13 and Lanning, 2012).

14
15
16 As Bosch and Charest (2008: 429) suggest, such inadequacies are foregrounded by LME
17 contexts, which have destabilised intermediate level vocational training whilst demarcating
18 graduate occupations. The consequence is a weakening of the VET system and its
19 responsiveness to new demands e.g. green skills. Evidently, the need to cultivate green
20 economic growth had started to permeate the UK Government's agenda from 2008, when a
21 'green skills' base was identified as vital to a low carbon transition (BERR, 2009). There
22 was, moreover, recognition that such skills provision was lacking within the VET system,
23 largely due to the exclusive reliance on employer demand to stimulate this and that such
24 demand was not forthcoming (Jagger et al, 2012). However, the intention to implement a
25 remedial green skills strategy has ostensibly been abandoned by the current government, and
26 wider environmental policies are increasingly being attacked (Harvey, 2011). A recent study
27 has identified that the UK has the largest green skills deficit across nine EU countries, and
28 that apposite VET provision has still to develop (IES, 2012). Significant barriers at firm-
29 level to the vision for, and investments in, such skills is compounded by prevailing social
30 norms in the UK, which have meant that 'green' issues tend not to be seen as offering
31 credible market opportunities and have frequently been viewed as an unnecessary restriction
32 on business, or at least as a secondary consideration (European Commission, 2009).

33
34
35 The type of 'pathway determinacy' within national economies that is described above is
36 subject to complex and nuanced readings (see Crouch 2001). Indeed, on CME arrangements
37 specifically, some commentators have pointed to their breakdown and put forward
38 'convergence/liberalization' arguments (see, for example, Howell 2003). However, there is
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 an evident difference between the extensive ‘greening’ of the CME-orientated German VET
4 system and the way the green skills agenda has emerged relatively recently in the UK in an
5 incipient top-down and state-centric form, which has failed to gain traction in any meaningful
6 way. The evidence we present confirms a distinctive variation of approach towards green
7 innovation and skills across our case study companies in Germany and the UK. The argument
8 is that these differences are principally attributable to the institutional contexts in which the
9 companies are located, rather than generated as part of managerial philosophy independent of
10 political and economic context.
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

20 **Methodology**

21 The (*Name deleted to maintain the integrity of the review process*) project was commissioned
22 under the Strategic Research Agenda of the European Steel Platform (ESTEP), which aims to
23 support a competitive and sustainable European industry and stimulate innovation to these
24 ends (ESTEP, 2010). One objective is the development of skills within the sector and the
25 (*Name deleted to maintain the integrity of the review process*) project was launched in 2010.
26 The project examined the extent to which environmental aspects are already incorporated into
27 technical VET across participant member states (i.e. Germany, Italy, Poland, UK) with a
28 view to developing such provision. The study focused on the apprenticeship programmes of
29 two occupational groups, mechanical and electrical engineering technicians. The industry
30 continues to rely on apprenticeships to provide it with the necessary stream of intermediate
31 level technicians. Moreover, these technical apprenticeships were deemed an apt focus of
32 study because there are significant environmental aspects to their work.
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42

43 Data from two of the case study companies – Tata Steel in Wales, UK and ThyssenKrupp
44 Steel Europe (TKSE) in Germany – form the basis of this paper. The research was conducted
45 in 2011 and guided by two principal research questions, which focused on exploring: i) the
46 industry’s ‘green’ training and skill needs, and ii) current industry/company strategies on
47 green skills training and environment policy and practice. The UK fieldwork was carried out
48 at the Llanwern and Port Talbot sites in South Wales. The Port Talbot site is an integrated
49 steelworks, producing hot-rolled, cold-rolled and metallic-plated strip products. The plant has
50 3000 directly-employed workers, and another 3000 sub-contractors. The Llanwern site has a
51 finishing capacity only, employing 1200 people. The TKSE plant is located in Duisburg. This
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 is an integrated plant employing approximately 13,000 people. It has the world's cleanest
4 coking plant and produces a range of hot-rolled and cold-rolled products.
5
6

7
8 In the first stage, semi-structured interviews were carried out with personnel from the
9 Environmental and Health & Safety departments at all sites. Thereafter, ten group interviews
10 were conducted on-site with Tata apprentices, line managers responsible for apprentices and
11 specialist training personnel. **Equivalent focus groups with apprentices were organised in**
12 **Germany.** Teaching staff from the relevant vocational school were interviewed in Germany
13 also, as well as representatives from BIBB and the regional (i.e. Länder) chamber of
14 commerce. In the UK, teaching staff from the further education college and two
15 representatives from SEMTA (the Sector Skills Council for Scientific, Engineering and
16 Manufacturing Technologies, and responsible for the Framework for Engineering
17 Apprenticeships) were interviewed. The interview data was augmented with documentary
18 evidence from company reports and policy documents.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29

30 **The Greening of Steel Work**

31 In what follows, we provide a comparative account of efforts to 'green' activities in the case
32 study companies and discuss the extent to which the strategies developed overlap with
33 training provision, particularly with regard to apprenticeships. We start by outlining the more
34 general approach taken by each company to environmental matters, including training in this
35 area, before we move on to discuss the apprenticeships at the two plants.
36
37
38
39
40

41 ***Orientation to the Environment***

42 There are significant variations in environmental policy and practice at the two plants.
43 TKSE's environmental performance is viewed as a 'key driver for innovation', leading to
44 'continuous improvement of the economic, environmental and social performance of the
45 company' (TKSE, 2011: 9). Various TKSE reports describe legislative compliance on the
46 environment as a 'given', detailing the plethora of voluntary measures that go beyond such
47 prescriptions (TKSE, 2011: 60). Tata, in contrast, states that 'its first priority is to remain
48 compliant and meet legislative requirements' (Tata Steel, 2011: 18). This compliance-driven
49 approach was confirmed by a number of interviewees, but it was also revealed that
50 compliance is not always attained. Indeed, the comparative difference in orientation towards
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 the environment is one of compliance at Tata and innovation at TKSE (see *Name deleted to*
4 *maintain the integrity of the review process*).
5
6

7
8 The basis of respective company performance on the environment is a reflection of
9 approaches to and attitudes towards environmental protection. Tata Port Talbot, for example,
10 has a 'small' Environmental Department established fifteen years ago, which has a principal
11 focus on legislative compliance. A small sub-team focuses on 'innovation' through capital
12 expenditure projects, but it is quite limited in focus - principally aimed at improving
13 compliance or enhancing process efficiency. Indeed, despite recognising that workforce
14 development on environmental matters might help the Department move away from its
15 current approach of 'reactive, fire-fighting', an environmental manager stated:
16
17
18
19
20
21

22
23 'If I had a guaranteed sum of money, I wouldn't spend it on training. It just wouldn't be a
24 priority.' (Tata, Port Talbot, 2011)
25
26

27
28 Interviewees from the Environmental Department argued that such environmental matters are
29 beginning to 'move up the [company's] agenda', but outside of this department, cynicism
30 was expressed, revealing a widespread perception that economic goals, such as cost and
31 output, are the key drivers. Indeed, the company's focus on environmental issues was
32 described as mere 'green CSR spin for customers' by a Technical Manager, and limited and
33 rudimentary environmental auditing processes confirm this.
34
35
36
37

38
39 At TKSE, environmental policy is said to be of central importance, with a 'long tradition'
40 (2011: 5). It describes its performance as far superior to that of competitor companies and this
41 was confirmed by interviewees at Tata Steel, who described TKSE as having implemented
42 pioneering environmental technology. The company's approach to the environment is largely
43 attributable to an overarching, Group-level sustainability management system, driven by the
44 parent company, ThyssenKrupp AG. The system is overseen by a sustainability management
45 officer and interdisciplinary sustainability team. At company level, this is supported by a
46 long-established Environment Department, with a team of section-based environmental
47 representatives who report to the parent group. These representatives conduct daily
48 environmental inspections and administer green skills audits. They are accountable to line
49 management in their respective areas, but have autonomy regarding the environmental
50 inspections, reporting directly to the parent group, a system described as 'highly effective'.
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5 The clear distinctions in approaches to the environment at company level are replicated in the
6 different orientations towards skills development (encompassing green skills) at the two
7 companies. TKSE places a high priority on developing employees, with each employee
8 receiving an average of three days of formal training per annum (Interview Notes, Trainer,
9 TKSE, Duisburg, 2011). Moreover, all employees participate in a developmental
10 performance management system, with a mandatory interview conducted annually. With
11 regard to formal environmental training, there is compulsory training for all managers, and if
12 employees require training in a particular environmental topic they contact the HR
13 Department:
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

21 'One of the main instruments to keep the employees up to date is an occupational qualification
22 plan assessing systematically what issues are relevant and which qualifications are needed in the
23 various work areas ... The plan covers, for example, legal mandatory qualifications and
24 requirements that arise in the context of commissions.... Therefore regular votes are taking place
25 in the enterprise [involving the department managers and employees] in order to organise
26 additional training.' (TKSE, Environmental Protection, Duisburg, 2011)
27
28
29
30
31

32 For further specialised training over a wide range of environmental topics the company
33 commissions the relevant professional association. Moreover, regular environmental training
34 updates are provided by the Prevention Officer for Environmental Protection and
35 disseminated across the plant at all levels. Significantly, employees are closely involved in
36 processes of environmental improvement and, as such, seminars are regularly offered to the
37 entire workforce.
38
39
40
41
42

43 At Tata, there is no dedicated environmental training programme. Standard operating
44 procedures, which specify correct and safe ways of working for all tasks, are in place and
45 accessible so as to direct behaviour and work performance. Operators are shown by
46 experienced workers how to work in accordance with these protocols meaning that
47 environmental aspects are implicit within the procedures, rather than explicitly articulated. In
48 terms of more formal training, there is a two-day induction for all new employees and this
49 incorporates an introduction to environmental issues, particularly on the financial costs of
50 non-compliance. Thereafter, environmental issues might be covered on 'Journey Days' (a
51 UK-wide, cross-plant culture change programme), or as part of section managers' 'Toolbox
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Talks' (designed to inform and instruct operatives about issues arising specific to work
4 areas). However, operations management 'do not always buy in to environmental concerns',
5 and so the latter might not constitute a high priority. Further, whilst environmental staff
6 explicitly acknowledge that it is operators who require rigorous environmental training, it is
7 managers that have access to training on such matters, including opportunities to pursue
8 professional qualifications – if they 'buy in' to this agenda.
9
10
11
12

13 *Apprenticeship Training*

14
15 The apprenticeship programmes under study here (i.e. mechanical and electrical technicians)
16 in both Germany and the UK are three years in duration. In the latter case, this constitutes a
17 relatively long period of study and is a reflection of the tradition of apprenticeship in this
18 sector, which in turn, has manifested generally in higher quality of provision (e.g. Hogarth et
19 al, 2012). This particular 'path dependency' was further reinforced in the 1960s and 70s,
20 when the UK developed and displayed many of the features associated with co-ordinated
21 economies (Thelen, 2009). However, there are distinct differences in how apprenticeship
22 training is delivered at the two companies, including within the vocational schools, or FE
23 colleges. More specifically, there is significant variation in the provision of training and
24 education on environmental aspects within the two systems.
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33

34 *Germany*

35
36 Within the German system, the public vocational schools provide technical training, as well
37 as general education. The large amount of classroom provision is required by law (Boreham,
38 2002). The schools are responsible for the delivery of framework curricula, devised by the
39 BIBB, to students (CEDEFOP, 2010b). Framework curricula exist for every recognised
40 training occupation and are harmonised with the training regulations. The curricula are
41 composed of 'learning fields', each focused on different job-specific content, and these fields
42 encompass subject content, time allocations and targets for achievement. The framework
43 curriculum for industrial mechanics comprises fifteen learning fields, whilst that for electrical
44 technicians is comprised of thirteen (Interview Notes, Trainer, TKSE, Duisburg,
45 2011). There is no dedicated learning field for environmental protection in either curriculum,
46 but these aspects are incorporated into the relevant job-specific topics. Specific 'green' skills
47 and their applications are explicitly identified in nine of the fifteen learning fields for
48 industrial mechanics and in seven of the thirteen fields for electrical technicians. Moreover,
49 both curricula contain general instructions as to environmental protection. Vocational schools
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 identify the ‘environmental threats’ that might arise in the course of the apprentices’ work
4 and furthermore, provide advice as to how such risks might be avoided and prevented. The
5 curricula for the two occupations also stipulate that students are to be educated about
6 environmental law and regulations.
7
8
9

10
11 Teaching staff from the vocational school described their aim as the inculcation of general
12 environmental awareness and understanding of sustainability in the apprentices, which is
13 indicative of the broader civic education that German apprenticeships offer (Brockmann et al,
14 2010). From this base, the focus becomes more specific, identifying how apprentices’ actions
15 at work impact on the environment. Particular environmental techniques, such as Life Cycle
16 Assessment, are taught. Environmental aspects of the technician role, such as emissions
17 control, waste management and resource efficiency are also taught in the classroom, with the
18 aim of:
19
20
21
22
23

24
25
26 ‘changing behaviour, through sensitizing students to a broader and underpinning environmental
27 perspective, thereby empowering them to take appropriate action in the workplace.’ (Teacher,
28 Vocational School, Duisburg, 2011)
29
30
31

32
33 There are formally assessed environmental projects and moreover, the external examination
34 held at the end of the programme, which must be passed if the apprentice is to achieve their
35 skilled worker certificate, contains five compulsory questions on the subjects of environment
36 and sustainability.
37
38
39

40
41 Before moving into a planned programme of rotation around a number of departments,
42 TKSE’s apprentices spend the first eighteen months of the programme in the company’s
43 dedicated and well-resourced technical training centre, working on company and occupation-
44 specific projects. The company aims to develop apprentices who are ‘capable of thinking and
45 acting independently’ and who can:
46
47
48
49

50
51 ‘participate and think in terms of real processes at work and apply their technical knowledge to
52 solve problems.’ (Trainer, TKSE, Duisburg, 2011)
53
54

55
56 Training staff stated that they aim to impart a level of understanding, to the extent that
57 trainees are able to:
58
59
60

1
2
3
4 'analyse the working process, be aware of and understand the possible impacts of their
5 actions... and to ultimately increase their autonomy.' (Trainer, TKSE, Duisburg, 2011)
6
7
8

9
10 TKSE trainers stressed the importance of developing 'work process knowledge'
11 (Arbeitsprozesswissen). This is comprised of holistic knowledge of the work process in the
12 enterprise, including understanding of the labour process, the production process and the
13 inter-relations between the various departments and functions (see Boreham, 2002). Such
14 knowledge is obviously deeper than that required to underpin a single job and the cultivation
15 of this broader understanding is argued to lead to an adaptable workforce, capable of
16 responding quickly and effectively to new work demands (see Boreham, 2002).
17
18
19
20
21

22
23 Of course, environmental aspects constitute one area of changing work demands, with one
24 trainer arguing that
25

26
27 'environmental, climate and safety regulations have affected the daily work enormously'
28 (Trainer, TKSE, Duisburg, 2011).
29
30
31

32
33 TKSE apprentices receive specific tuition on relevant environmental topics and are given
34 work-related environmental projects to complete. The company trainers state that these are
35 designed so as to 'illustrate how legislation applies in practice.' **The apprentices agreed that
36 this practical application was what they valued:**
37
38
39

40 'I learn best through the practical exercises we're given at college and in the workplace.
41 It is important to be able to have the space to learn by actually undertaking a project and
42 then having guidance on any mistakes made.' (Industrial mechanic apprentice, TKSE,
43 Duisburg, 2011).
44
45
46
47

48
49 The ultimate aim is the development of staff 'capable of critical thinking and autonomous
50 action' regarding environmental protection, and this practical 'learning by doing' approach
51 cultivates this independence of thought and action. All of the German apprentices
52 interviewed stated that they were very keen to receive extensive education on the subject of
53 environmental protection and indeed, pursue additional qualifications. **For example, one**
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 trainee stated that he wished to pursue a Masters level qualification in the area, and that this
4 interest had been stimulated by the content provided on the apprenticeship programme.
5
6
7

8 All participants were able to offer comprehensive definition of what constitutes 'green skills'
9 and moreover, accurately distinguished between the key environmental aspects of their roles
10 (e.g. management of waste and hazardous materials, control of particulate emissions) and
11 those of lesser import in their particular positions (e.g. resource and energy efficiency issues).

12
13 The trainees had sufficient background knowledge to identify where they wished further
14 input on environmental aspects:
15
16
17

18
19
20 'More input on frequency converters, control engineering and the treatment of oils and
21 hydraulic systems would be helpful.' (Industrial mechanical apprentice, TKSE,
22 Duisburg, 2011).
23
24
25

26 The German apprentices unanimously reported that they had 'very high levels of
27 environmental awareness' and attributed these, in part, to their 'personal backgrounds and
28 upbringing', as well as the education received at secondary school, where environmental
29 aspects are high on the agenda (ECORYS, 2010) – which may be seen as a reflection of the
30 wider cultural and societal value placed on environmental protection in this CME context
31 (e.g. Sagiv and Schwartz, 2007).
32
33
34
35
36
37

38 *The United Kingdom*

39 The experience of the Tata apprentices differs significantly from that of their German
40 counterparts. As in Germany, there are no dedicated modules or classes pertaining to
41 environmental legislation, sustainability issues, technical skills, or particular environmental
42 techniques. However, whereas training on the environment can be explicitly identified within
43 'learning fields' in Germany, training content on the environment is notable by its absence
44 within the UK apprenticeships. All of the apprentices interviewed were unanimous that
45 environmental legislation and topics were covered in the most cursory of fashions in the
46 education they received off-the-job in college. Apprentices' comments ranged from 'No, we
47 haven't covered anything' to:
48
49
50
51
52
53
54

55
56 'I think it was briefly mentioned in college at the beginning of the course, but I can't tell you
57 what was covered.' (Industrial mechanic apprentice, Tata, Port Talbot, 2011)
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5 Apprentices commented that a significant emphasis is placed on workers' health and safety,
6 both in college and in the workplace and that they are instructed how to conduct risk
7 assessments as to their personal safety, but connections with environmental protection are not
8 drawn. Indeed, prior to commencing the workplace phase of study, the 'engineering
9 apprentices' completed a workbook entitled 'Employee Rights and Responsibilities', which
10 assessed their knowledge of legislation relevant to their work (such as health and safety), but
11 this did not include environmental legislation.
12
13
14
15

16
17
18 At the workplace, Tata apprentices stated that there had been no specific, formal off-the-job
19 training on environmental issues, aside from induction and one Journey Day. For
20 apprentices, as well as operators, there is a heavy emphasis on task-based, experiential
21 learning – such practices are also evident within TKSE and reflect historically based sector
22 practices and organisational features on workplace learning (see Stroud, 2012). However, less
23 formal development methods, such as 'learning by doing', can facilitate the passing on of
24 'bad practice' and the potential for the establishment of erroneous ways of working,
25 particularly where – in contrast to the German plant – experienced workers are not certified
26 trainers (see Gibb, 2011). Moreover, the onus is placed on the apprentices to ask questions
27 based on their observations, leading to a variable quality of learning experience:
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35

36 'It depends on who's showing you what to do, how organised the department is and how much
37 time they've got for you.' (Electronic technician apprentice, Tata, Llanwern, 2011).
38
39
40

41 When asked about the environmental aspects of their roles, the interviewees only identified
42 waste disposal and this was limited to placing materials in appropriate bins – none of the
43 apprentice interviewees could define 'green skills'. One stated:
44
45
46
47

48 'It's probably not taken that seriously [by apprentices] because of that tree-hugging
49 image'. (Industrial mechanical apprentice, Tata, Llanwern, 2011).
50
51

52 The apprentices did recognise that environmental aspects are part of procedure and stated that
53 as long as they follow the operating instructions and know the 'way to do the job properly',
54 environmental protection will be achieved. However, as a number of apprentices stated:
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 'I know what I've got to do, but I don't know why I've got to do it like that... I don't know what
4 the consequences would be if I didn't follow the instructions.' (Electronic technician apprentice,
5 Tata, Port Talbot).
6
7

8
9 This statement reflects the philosophy and practice of the NVQ. NVQs themselves replicate
10 the dominant production paradigm in the UK of Taylorist mass production (Lane, 1995) i.e.
11 strict division of labour, narrowly task-focused work, lack of training and standardised,
12 repetitive, production processes. Within NVQ structures, learning is principally work-based,
13 courses are assessment-driven, assessments consist of compiling evidence of competence in
14 the workplace, and the theoretical content has been reduced to the minimum deemed
15 necessary to 'underpin' performance (Boreham, 2002; Grugulis, 2003).
16
17
18
19
20
21

22 It has been strongly argued that such limited task-based competence and strict procedural
23 adherence, reinforced by the NVQ model, results in a lack of problem-solving ability and
24 restricts the capacity of workers to respond to changes and new situations (Mason, 2005).
25 Potentially, the latter could include changes reflecting environmentally-friendly and
26 sustainable ways of working, but SEMTA suggests developments in this area are limited
27 (Interview Notes, SEMTA representatives, 2011). In an attempt to emulate the German
28 apprenticeship model and address emerging deficiencies, the previous Labour administration
29 introduced technical certificates as a required element in higher-level apprenticeships in
30 2002. It was intended that the technical certificates would impart broader understanding of
31 theoretical principles, which policy-makers believed were equipping German apprentices
32 with the capacity 'to undertake a wider range of tasks and to respond more quickly and
33 effectively to new work demands' (DfEE, 1998: 10). Optional in 2005, certificates were re-
34 introduced as a requirement under the ASCL Act, although critics continue to point to the
35 deficiencies of the UK system (e.g. Steedman, 2010; Fuller and Unwin, 2012). Indeed, Tata
36 apprentices from across all three years of study, including those that had completed their
37 technical certificates, confirm a continuing deficiency of deeper understanding, particularly
38 where environmental aspects are concerned.
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51

52 Discussion

53 Sustainable development and the regulation of environmental issues is a relatively recent
54 policy direction for the EU, but it is growing in importance and scope (see European
55 Commission, 2010). The various EU directives and regulations on the environment (and other
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 related ones e.g. health and safety) eventually filter through to company policy and practice
4 by way of member states and their distinctive policy imperatives and regulatory frameworks.
5
6 Complying with environmental regulation (and training to meet regulations) is a company's
7
8 minimum obligation, and this is generally manifested where directives/regulations penetrate
9
10 operations. However, innovation on environmental issues is focused by investment and this
11
12 might happen in a number of ways; through capital investment, but also the investment of
13
14 resources in the greening of the labour process. Clearly, our evidence suggests Tata and
15
16 TKSE approach environmental issues in quite different ways. Each company exhorts CSR
17
18 regarding the environment, but there is a distinct variation of approach towards the
19
20 environment and green skills across the two cases.

21
22 In the German context, institutions such as the structure of the financial system and provision
23
24 and availability of capital, social partnership and high skill levels have, in general, facilitated
25
26 a more developmental, longer-term perspective. Being situated within this context facilitates
27
28 TKSE's high value-added strategy, which is based on technological innovation and a highly
29
30 skilled workforce who are capable not only of responding to change but actively contributing
31
32 to it, through continuous improvement activity. It is moreover, equally applicable to the
33
34 firm's environmental agenda. The long-established political strength of the green party,
35
36 extensive environmental legislation, and high levels of environmental awareness in the wider
37
38 society provide support for environmental protection. Subsequently, environmental
39
40 regulation, and the consequent need to improve environmental performance, is viewed as an
41
42 economic opportunity to innovate through further investment in new technology and
43
44 crucially, complementary skills.

45
46 Thus, the inclusive approach to employee development evident at TKSE encompasses the
47
48 environmental aspects of workers' jobs and apprenticeship provision, with high quality
49
50 training comprehensively provided. Such training aims to develop knowledge and attitudes
51
52 that enable workers to use their autonomy and apply their problem-solving abilities, thereby
53
54 securing continuous improvements. At TKSE, company training is complemented by high-
55
56 quality VET and apprenticeship systems – the relationship between company training and the
57
58 VET system is governed by the training regulations that exist for each designated occupation
59
60 (see Bosch and Charest, 2008). Companies must have training plans, which are structured by
these training regulations, and the latter have been modified and updated to include
environmental aspects, across all occupations. This greening has been driven by organic

1
2
3 collaboration between the social partners (CEDEFOP 2010a), meaning that the German VET
4 system both shapes and responds to employers' training needs. Indeed, the high levels of in-
5 firm training, the supportive VET system and the reliance on the participative efforts of the
6 workforce within TKSE, in conjunction with strong (environmental) legislation operating as a
7 'beneficial constraint' (Streeck, 2004) seems to suggest continuity of CME arrangements, and
8 resistance to 'liberalization' (cf. Hassel, 2012).
9
10
11
12

13
14 There is a clear contrast with the situation at Tata where a short-term financial perspective
15 dominates that company's decision-making processes, characteristic of LME contexts (Kemp
16 and Loorbach 2006). The focus here is on compliance with regulation and where innovation
17 is evident it focuses on immediate cost reductions, rather than longer term strategies such as
18 those focused on investment in workforce development. The latter is further undermined by
19 institutional frameworks that dis-incentivise such developments. The green agenda is
20 perceived as a restriction on business, rather than opportunity, which reflects the extant value
21 orientation of the wider polity (see *Name deleted to maintain the integrity of the review*
22 *process*; Sagiv and Schwartz, 2007). Economic goals take precedence over environmental
23 aspects at Tata and although there are benefits to be gained from such efficiency drives,
24 without embedded recognition that pursuing long-term environmental goals can only be
25 beneficial, any behavioural changes are likely to be externally imposed and therefore short-
26 lived, signified by the Environmental Department's description of their approach as one of
27 'reactive fire-fighting' or trying to enforce compliance with regulations. **Our evidence**
28 **suggests that such deficits extend to (engineering) apprenticeships provision.**
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40

41 In general, there are systematic disincentives for greening workforce development within the
42 LME context of the UK (Hall and Soskice, 2001). Endemic short-termism and a heavy
43 emphasis on assured, definitive financial payback undermine long-term human-capital
44 development projects. Moreover, and by reflection, the VET system has long been criticised
45 for its deficiencies. To focus specifically on green skills, the VET system has failed to
46 'green' extant provision and incorporate apposite environmental content (Jagger et al, 2012;
47 IES 2012). This shortcoming in public educational provision – itself a reproduction of a lack
48 of employer demand – was identified by all the Tata apprentices. Our data shows that the lack
49 of formal training and concomitantly, the heavy emphasis on task-based learning for
50 apprentices, means that these trainees have a limited understanding of the implications of
51 their actions (or inactions) and the potential impact upon the environment. The stress on rigid
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 adherence to standard operating procedures, in which environmental aspects are implicitly
4 incorporated, can curtail workers' problem-solving ability, their ability to adapt to novel
5 situations as well as inhibiting the proposal of suggestions as to how improvements might be
6 made. Of course, steel-making is a potentially hazardous occupation and safe working
7 procedures must be specified and should be adhered to, but unbending conformity to 'one
8 best way' of working, fostered under the dominant production paradigm of Taylorist mass
9 production, can stifle responsiveness to changed working practice (Mason, 2005).
10
11
12
13
14
15

16 **Conclusion**

17 The EU's transition toward sustainable economic growth is likely to be uneven across
18 member states. Our analysis shows that without clear objectives to create and promote green
19 skills, within the paradigm of transition to a low carbon economy, it will be unlikely that such
20 goals will be fully realised. The value of the VoC typology is that it allows a specification of
21 the relationship between state, labour and capital in relation to innovation on the environment
22 and the greening of skills. In particular, it seems the CME environment is more conducive to
23 stimulating and enabling change. The German case demonstrates the importance of broader
24 engagement on skills and training – particularly where VET systems are concerned. Here, as
25 industrial sectors restructure and respond to extensive environmental legislation, a
26 collaborative infrastructure – supported by public policy focused on environmental protection
27 – penetrates managerial philosophies and articulates environmental policy as a source of
28 innovation and opportunity, thus facilitating the greening of occupational competences and
29 training regulations at the level of the firm. This process of collaboration stands in stark
30 contrast to the LME environment, where there is a more general absence of direction from the
31 state on the greening of the economy, and beyond efforts to comply with regulations, little
32 engagement on the greening of skills at firm level. Evidently, it is much more likely that EU
33 ambitions (and sector pledges) will be realised where member states in collaboration with
34 others play a central role in formulating and developing (VET) strategies that are focused on
35 transition.
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52

53 **References**

54 Blühdorn, I. (2009) 'Reinventing Green Politics: On the Strategic Repositioning of the
55 German Green Party.' *German Politics*, 18, 36-54.
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Boreham, N. (2002) 'Work Process Knowledge, Curriculum Control and the Work-Based
4 Route to Occupational Qualifications.' *British Journal of Educational Studies* 50, 225-37.
5
6

7
8 Bosch, G. and Charest, J. (2008) 'Vocational training and the labour market in liberal and co-
9 ordinated economies.' *Industrial Relations Journal*, 39, 428-47.
10

11
12 Brockmann, M., Clarke, L. and Winch, C. (2010) 'The Apprenticeship Framework in
13 England: A new beginning or a continuing sham?' *Journal of Education and Work*, 23, 111-
14 127.
15
16

17
18
19 CEDEFOP (2010a) *Skills for Green Jobs: A European Synthesis Report*. Luxembourg: EU
20 Publications Office.
21

22
23
24 CEDEFOP (2010b) *VET in Europe: Germany Country Report*. Luxembourg: EU
25 Publications Office.
26

27
28
29 Crouch, C. (2001) 'Heterogeneities of practice and interest: feature review of Models of
30 Capitalism.' *New Political Economy*, 6, 131-35
31
32

33
34 DfEE (Department for Education and Employment) (1998) *First Report of the National Skills
35 Task Force: Towards a National Skills Agenda*. London: DfEE.
36
37

38
39 Dierdorff, E., Norton, J., Drewes, D., Kroustalis, C., Rivkin, D. and Lewis, P. (2009)
40 *Greening of the World of Work: Implications for New and Emerging Occupations*. Report
41 for U.S. Department of Labor Employment and Training Administration, Washington, DC.
42 National Center for O*NET Development, February 12, 2009.
43
44
45

46
47
48 Dolphin, T. and Lanning, T. (2011) *Rethinking Apprenticeships*. London: IPPR.
49

50
51 ECORYS (2010) *Programmes to promote environmental skills*. Report for the DG
52 Environment of the European Commission, Rotterdam: ECORYS Nederland.
53
54

55
56 ESTEP (2010) *A Bridge to the Future: 2010 Activity Report*. Brussels: European
57 Commission.
58
59

1
2
3
4 European Commission (2009) Attitudes of European Citizens towards the Environment.
5
6 Luxembourg: Publications Office.
7
8

9
10 European Commission (2010) *Europe 2020: A European strategy for smart, sustainable and*
11 *inclusive growth*. Luxembourg: Publications Office.
12

13
14 Fuller, A. and Unwin, L. (2012) 'Banging on the Door of the University: the Complexities of
15 Progression from Apprenticeship and other Vocational Programmes in England', *SKOPE*
16 *Monograph 14*, Oxford: University of Oxford.
17
18

19
20
21 Gospel, H. and Pendleton, A. (2003) 'Finance, Corporate Governance and the Management
22 of Labour: A Conceptual and Comparative Analysis', *British Journal of Industrial Relations*,
23 41, 557–82.
24
25

26
27
28 Grugulis, I. (2003) 'The contribution of NVQs to the growth of skills in the UK.' *British*
29 *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 41, 457-475.
30
31

32
33 Hall, P. and Soskice, D. (2001) 'An Introduction to Varieties of Capitalism.' In P. Hall and
34 D. Soskice (eds) *Varieties of Capitalism: The Institutional Foundations of Comparative*
35 *Advantage*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
36
37

38
39 Harvey, F. (2011) 'Autumn statement: George Osborne slams 'costly' green policies.' *The*
40 *Guardian*, 29 November 2011.
41
42

43
44
45 Hassell, A. (2012) 'The Paradox of Liberalization — Understanding Dualism and the
46 Recovery of the German Political Economy', *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, Article
47 first published online: 20 September 2012. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-8543.2012.00913.x
48
49

50
51 Hogarth, T., Gambin, L. and Hasluck, C. (2012) 'Apprenticeships in
52 England: What next?' *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 64, 41-55.
53
54

55
56 Hoskins, B., D'Hombres, B. and Campbell, J. (2008) 'Does formal education have an impact
57 on active citizenship behaviour?' *European Educational Research Journal*, 7, 386-402.
58
59

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Howell, C. (2003) 'Varieties of capitalism: and then there was one?' *Comparative Politics*, 36, 103-24.

Huang, J., van den Brink, H. and Groot, W. (2012) 'Does education promote social capital? Evidence from IV analysis and nonparametric-bound analysis. *Empirical Economics*, 42, 1011-1034.

IES (2012) 'Green skills and Environmental Awareness in Vocational Education and Training Synthesis Report.' *Research Paper 24, European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP)*, June 2012.

Jagger, N., Foxon, T. and Gouldson, A. (2012) *Skill Constraints for Low Carbon Transitions*. Centre for Climate Change Economics and Policy, Working Paper 96. London: LSE.

Keep, E., Mayhew, K. and Payne, J. (2006) 'From Skills Revolution to Productivity Miracle - Not as Easy as it Sounds?' *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 22, 539-59.

Kemp, R. and Loorbach, D. (2006) 'Transition management: a reflexive governance approach.' In Voss, J., Kemp, R. and Bauknecht, D. (eds.) *Reflexive Governance for Sustainable Development* 103-130. Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar.

Lane, C. (1995) *Industry and Society in Europe: Stability and Change in Britain, Germany and France*. Aldershot: Edward Elgar.

Lloyd, C. and Payne, J. (2002) 'Developing a Political Economy of Skill.' *Journal of Education and Work*, 15, 365-390.

Lydenberg, S. (2009) 'Building the Case for Long-Term Investing in Stock Markets: Breaking Free from the Short-Term Measurement Dilemma.' In de Bettignies, H. and Lépineux, F. (eds) *Finance for a Better World - The Shift toward Sustainability* 168-186. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

1
2
3 Mason, G. (2005) *Enterprise Product Strategies and Employer Demand for Skills in Britain: Evidence from the Employer Skills Survey*. SKOPE Research Paper 50. Oxford: SKOPE.

4
5
6
7
8 Ryan, P. and Unwin, L. (2001) 'Apprenticeship in the British Training Market.' *National Institute Economic Review* No.178, October.

9
10
11
12 Sagiv, L. and Schwartz, S. (2007) 'Cultural values in organisations: insights for Europe.' *European J. International Management*, 1, 176-190

13
14
15
16
17 Steedman, H. (2005) *Apprenticeship for Europe: Fading or Flourishing? Centre for Economic Performance Discussion Paper 710*, December 2005.

18
19
20
21
22 Steedman, H. (2010) *The State of Apprenticeship 2010: International Comparisons – Australia, Austria, England, France, Germany, Ireland, Sweden, Switzerland: A Report for the Apprenticeship Ambassadors Network*, London: Centre for Economic Performance, London School of Economics and Political Science.

23
24
25
26
27 Streeck, W. (1992) *Social Institutions and Economic Performance: Studies of Industrial Relations in Advanced Capitalist Economies*, London: Sage.

28
29
30
31 Streeck, W. (2004) 'Educating capitalists: a rejoinder to Wright and Tsakalotos'. *Socio-Economic Review*, 2, 425–37.

32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41 Tata Steel (various) *Corporate Citizenship Reports*. Retrieved May 11 2011

42
43 (<http://www.tatasteeleurope.com/en/news/publications/>)

44
45
46
47 ThyssenKrupp (various) *Annual Sustainability Reports*. Retrieved May 11, 2011

48 (<http://www.thyssenkrupp-steel-europe.com/en/portraet/nachhaltigkeit/>)

49
50
51 Thelen, K. (2009) 'Institutional Change in Advanced Political Economies.' *British Journal of Industrial Relations* , 47, 471–498.

52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59 Tylecote, A. and Conesa E. (1999) 'Corporate Governance, Innovation Systems & Industrial Performance', *Industry & Innovation*, 6, 25-50.